



UPHOLDING HUMAN DIGNITY: A LITERATURE REVIEW

Findings Report

March 2022

Submitted to:

Catholic Relief Services
228 W Lexington St
Baltimore, MD 21201

Submitted by:

The Pulte Institute for Global Development
University of Notre Dame
3150 Jenkins Nanovic Halls
Notre Dame, IN 46556



PULTE INSTITUTE
FOR GLOBAL DEVELOPMENT



CATHOLIC RELIEF SERVICES

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	3
Human Dignity in Development	3
The Importance of Dignity in Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability, and Learning (MEAL)	3
Collaboration on Defining and Measuring Dignity	4
METHODOLOGY	4
Search Strategy	4
Development of the Concept Matrix	5
DIGNITY-RELATED CONCEPTS: MAJOR FINDINGS	7
High-Density Concepts	7
Acceptance of Identity	8
Inclusion	10
Acknowledgement	12
Independence, Autonomy, and Agency	14
Medium- Density Concepts	16
Humiliation	18
Respect	19
Seek Understanding	21
Accountability	22
Self-Esteem	24
Empowerment	26
Low- Density, but Important, Concepts	27
Transparency and Communication	28
Opportunity	29
Self-Reliance	30
MEASUREMENT TOOL MATRIX	32
KEY SUMMARY POINTS NEXT STEPS	33
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	35
WORKS CITED	36
Appendix A: Measurement Tools for Dignity-Related Concepts	0

INTRODUCTION

Human Dignity in Development

The Global Development sector, by and large, is focused on providing aid to countries globally through financial means and implementing projects to improve the lives of individuals across a variety of sectors. By doing so, the development sector seeks to directly influence human development which by nature, includes all aspects of the human experience. With humans being the center of focus in the development sector, respect for human dignity is a central theme in the field and is an oft-cited concept in the mission statements, vision statements, and guiding principles of a wide variety of development and humanitarian organizations. Despite this, human dignity is a somewhat nebulous concept that is loosely defined depending on the sector and the perspective from which it is being described, made even more so by noticeable lack of frameworks to operationalize the concept in practice. Additionally, a measurement for determining if and how human dignity is affected by actions in the development sector vary depending on context as well as the cultural setting under which human dignity is being explored. As part of the effort to develop measures of human dignity, the authors propose the following operational definition for human dignity:

Human dignity is the inherent value that every individual possesses equally by virtue of being a human being, independent of one's abilities, characteristics, or actions.

Respect for human dignity is acknowledgement of that inherent value by individuals, institutions, and society.

The Importance of Dignity in Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability, and Learning (MEAL)

Few would argue against the fact that the resulting deepened commitment to MEAL by development actors over the past decade has increased the professionalism and accountability of global development work. MEAL has developed an obsession with objective metrics of success, and as such, development work as a whole has followed suit. Nevertheless, extensive experience in the field has revealed that a significant number of practitioners and policy-makers, while overtly supportive of the ideals of MEAL will, behind closed doors, quietly bemoan how MEAL is removing the human element from global development work to which they passionately devoted their work life. One champion of MEAL worried that the emphasis on MEAL was “sucking the life and joy out of development work”. The current moment in history provides an opportune time to open the door to subjective metrics that seek to step inside the internal world of an individual's thoughts, feelings, and experiences. Humans experience the world subjectively, and so we can only fully comprehend human growth, experiences, self-expression, dignity, and flourishing within development and humanitarian processes by incorporating this information. In better understanding how interventions affect a person's experience of their human dignity, we can uphold interventions that not only deliver objective outcomes, but also could be considered to be

dignity-affirming. This will provide a more holistic perspective on the success or failure of different ways of doing development.

The first guiding principle of Catholic Relief Services is Sacredness and Dignity of the Human Person, which states, “Created in the image of God, all human life is sacred and possesses a dignity that comes directly from our creation and not from any action of our own.” Upholding the dignity inherent in every human being is at the core of CRS’ mission. CRS has found that **humanitarian and development efforts are truly transformative when they enhance the human dignity of vulnerable and marginalized individuals** as an integral part of reducing poverty, preventing disease, and improving living conditions.

Collaboration on Defining and Measuring Dignity

To fill the gap in metrics of success and with support from the GHR Foundation, CRS is working with the University of Notre Dame to **develop a measure of affirmation of human dignity that can be used across programming sectors in global development work**. In addition to advancing understanding of the role human dignity plays in development, the measure is also intended to encourage projects to explicitly consider and incorporate dignity-related aspects of interventions into program design.

By collaborating and sharing the measure with other stakeholders, we aim to influence development actors to measure affirmation of dignity outcomes together with sectoral outcomes. Ultimately, we envision reaching a stage when **humanitarian and development stakeholders routinely measure how participant’s human dignity is affirmed and perceived and account for human dignity when designing, implementing, and evaluating programs and policies**. This will help ensure that development program staff focus not only on what is achieved, but also how it is achieved through affirming the inherent dignity in their fellow human beings in the process of facilitating social impact.

The goal of this work is to assess how human dignity is not only defined but how affirmation of it is measured across sectors, as well as to identify perspectives to consider in developing a measurement that can be used to better inform humanitarian and development programming.

METHODOLOGY

Search Strategy

The objective of the literature review process was to identify existing definitions of human dignity and determine instances when elements related to affirmation or violation of human dignity were measured. A second phase of the literature review then focused on tools that have been developed related to measurement of dignity-related concepts that could inform the development of an evaluation tool. The initial desk research process was divided into three academic literature categories: medical literature, human rights and law, and international development literature. Approximately 124 articles consisting of peer-reviewed journal articles, white papers, and

publications found in the grey literature were reviewed. Articles were included in the review if they categorized dignity or if they operationalized dignity in the field. Notably, scholars in palliative care, theology, philosophy, and refugee justice frequently contributed to dignity literature. Articles were highlighted for relevance based on the perspective from which they were written, the Dignity Conceptualization Level, and any indication of a Dignity- Associated Concept. In many cases, articles contained information that described dignity at several conceptualization levels and accounted for several concepts. Lastly, tools to measure dignity-associated concepts were identified. Depending on the concept, additional research was conducted to identify any tools outside of the existing literature that could be used to measure dignity.

Development of the Concept Matrix

Individual conceptual levels focused on how an individual internally recognizes a concept, for example self-esteem. A social dignity conceptualization level determined whether the concept existed externally in intrapersonal relationships, e.g. acknowledgement. Finally, a structural, societal level was a concept found in an institutional level systemic process, e.g. transparency and communication. Depending on the literature, some dignity-associated concepts shared multiple conceptualization levels.

After the team determined the conceptualization level, they divided the literature based on perspective. Articles could be sourced from a Non-Western, Western-Secular, Western-Catholic, or Western-Other Faith based perspective. The perception level helped the team understand the background and key proponents behind identified dignity-associated concepts. Again, some dignity-related concepts spanned across multiple perspectives creating overlaps in categorization.

Catholic Relief Services (CRS) reviewed the list of concepts and during a workshop CRS staff prioritized concepts that most aligned with their mission and current activities. CRS determined that 14 out of 42 dignity-associated concepts were designated relevant to the mission of Catholic Relief Services. 14 concepts, four had *High relevance*, seven had *Medium relevance*, and three had *Low relevance*. Based on the prioritization of concepts, the literature was reviewed for tools that could measure human dignity related to the 14 identified dignity-associated concepts. This information was used to complete the concept matrix. A summary of this matrix can be found in **Table 1**.

Table 1: Literature Identified for Dignity-Associated Concepts		
Low	Medium	High
Transparency and Communication: 6 articles identified.	Self-esteem: 7 articles identified. Dignity Conceptualization Levels: individual	Independence, Autonomy, and Agency: 55 articles identified.

<p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: structural, societal</p> <p>Perspectives: Western-Secular</p>	<p>Perspectives: Non-Western, Western-Secular</p>	<p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: individual, structural, societal</p> <p>Perspectives: Western-Secular; Non-Western; Western-Catholic</p>
<p>Self-Reliance: 3 articles identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: individual</p> <p>Perspectives: Western-Secular</p>	<p>Seek Understanding: 13 articles identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: Social</p> <p>Perspectives: Non-Western, Western-Secular</p>	<p>Inclusion: 22 articles identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: social, structural, societal</p> <p>Perspectives: Western-Secular; Non-Western</p>
<p>Opportunity: 1 article identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: structural, societal</p> <p>Perspectives: Western-Secular</p>	<p>Safety: 23 articles identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: Individual, Structural, Societal, Social</p> <p>Perspectives: Western-Secular; Non-Western; Western-Other Faith-Based; Western-Catholic</p>	<p>Acknowledgement: 31 articles identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: social</p> <p>Perspectives: Western-Secular; Non-Western; Western-Other Faith-Based; Western-Catholic</p>
	<p>Respect: 34 articles identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: Structural, Societal, Social</p> <p>Perspectives: Non-Western, Western-Secular</p>	<p>Acceptance of Identity: 31 articles identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: individual, social.</p> <p>Perspectives: Western-Secular; Non-Western; Western-Other Faith-Based; Western-Catholic</p>
	<p>Humiliation: 18 articles identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: Social, Structural, Societal</p> <p>Perspectives: Non-Western, Western-Secular</p>	
	<p>Empowerment to Participate/Voice/ Agency: 26 articles identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: Structural, Societal</p> <p>Perspectives: Non-Western, Western-Catholic, Western-Secular</p>	

	<p>Accountability: 16 articles identified.</p> <p>Dignity Conceptualization Levels: Individual, Structural, Societal</p> <p>Perspectives: Western-Secular; Non-Western; Western-Catholic</p>	
Total: 10 associations.	Total: 137 associations.	Total: 139 associations.

The totals in **Table 1** are not the total number of individual articles for each category. Rather, they are the number of associations to each concept found within the relevant literature. The greater number of associations demonstrate the overlapping dignity conceptualization levels and perspectives held within a single concept. For example, the concept of *safety* is shared across all the dignity conceptualization levels and perspectives.

DIGNITY-RELATED CONCEPTS: MAJOR FINDINGS

To further contextualize the dignity-associated concepts and their associated definitions, key findings have been summarized for each concept. These summaries have been broken down by the prioritization level defined by CRS.

High-Density Concepts

Dignity-associated concepts that are categorized as high-density are those that are heavily cited in the literature and have been identified by CRS as a concept that is in alignment with their conceptualization of human dignity. There are four major dignity-associated themes that include Acceptance of Identity, Inclusion, Acknowledgement, and Independence, Autonomy and Agency. The concepts identified in this section can be cited from several different conceptualization levels as well as perspectives in the literature. Further details about these concepts can be found in the **Table 2** below.

Table 2: High- Density Concept Matrix Summary			
Concept	Concept Description	Dignity Conceptualization Level	Perspective
Acceptance of Identity	Acceptance of identity is the embracing of ones and others authentic selves without fear of negative consequence.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Individual (internal) Social (external) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Western- Secular Non-Secular Western- Other Faith- Based Western- Catholic

Inclusion	The UN’s Department of Economic and Social Affairs defines inclusion “as the process of improving the terms of participation in society for people who are disadvantaged on the basis of age, sex, disability, race, ethnicity, and economic and migration status” (2016).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social (external) • Structural and Societal (systemic, external) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Western- Secular • Non-Western
Acknowledgement	“Dignity is fundamental in this context to ensure that people with disabilities are not continually cast in the role of supplicants asking for their rights to be recognized but that their rights are acknowledged as a matter of course in the same way as everyone else” (Bell 2007).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social (external) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Western- Secular • Non- Secular • Western- Other Faith- Based • Western- Catholic
Independence, Autonomy and Agency	Independence, autonomy, and agency hinge on human rights enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and Constitutions that grant a human being physical, cognitive, and emotional capability to develop and execute a decision-making power to live with dignity, empowerment, and respect.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual (internal) • Structural and Societal (external) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Western- Secular • Non- Western • Western- Catholic

Acceptance of Identity

Definition

Two working definitions of acceptance of identify were identified in the literature: Acceptance of identity is the embracing of one’s and others’ authentic selves without fear of negative consequence. In practice, acceptance of identities means approaching people as neither inferior or superior; interacting without prejudice or bias, accepting the roles of race, religion, ethnicity, gender, class, sexual orientation, age, disability, etc. in the core of people’s identities. In accepting identity, one offers integrity to others.

Acceptance of identity can be considered a two-part process in authenticity. Acceptance of identity is given to others and accepted internally. In relation to dignity, when people honor and esteem each other, they “enhance the dignity of others and themselves.” (Jacobson 2012, 131) Authenticity forces one to recognize, accept, and value one’s own true self, then reflecting that self to the world (Jacobson 2012, 131).

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

Acceptance of identity is conceptualized within non-Western justice, conflict studies, psychology, and Catholic literature.

Within indigenous and non-Western justice, acceptance of identity is directly linked to protections of one's individual dignity. These cases illustrate the loss of dignity when a person's identity is attacked. An infamous case is the French and German banning of hijab wearing, which specifically targets Muslim women. "The hijab is now commonly regarded as a symbol of Muslim identity and dignity for Muslim women, despite the fact that the extent to which a woman should cover herself has always been subject to differing interpretations." (Lee 2008, 27). As French and German Muslim women were legally denied to wear a hijab, they were forced to defend their identity to their governments. It should be noted that freedom of religion differs from freedom of identity. Religion, as it is understood in Western contexts, as a private belief system does not reflect the intertwining of religion and identity in other communities. "In certain indigenous contexts it is not possible to dissociate as easily as in the West and in ruling societies between what is religious, which would fall within the intimate and private sphere." (Isa 2014, 753). The tenet of freedom of religion only defends a slice of what is considered *identity*.

Like conceptions of non-Western justice, the rejection of identity acceptance is explored in conflict studies. Identity is again defined as two-parts, how individuals see themselves and others. Conflicts within individuals and groups are defined as intra-unit identity. Alternatively, across individuals, groups, organizations inter-unit identity conflicts are capable of breaking out. For identity acceptance to occur within intra-unit conflicts, inherent causes that are raising tensions must be addressed. For example, Bangladeshi women entrepreneurs are frustrated by intra-unit behavioral norms, which "reveal inherent conflicts in "taken for granted" elements of modern markets and the "rules of the game" advocated within Bangladeshi communities." (Horton et. al 2014, S10). Comparatively, inter-unit conflict is born out of polarization between collective banding. International joint ventures are a method of mediating identity conflicts. Nevertheless, power asymmetries can prolong intra-unit, especially if the, "conflicting identities are ascribed, deep-structured, or situated." (Horton et. al 2014, S12).

In the psychology realm, the rejection and acceptance of ostracized identities is studied. This literature speaks to the harmful effects of ostracization due to identity upon individuals. Furthermore, this body of literature also speaks to how acceptance of individuals and collectives improves relationships. Compared to the previous two fields, acceptance of identity manifests itself physically within individuals' bodies.

Finally, in Catholic teaching, acceptance of identity is woven into the concept of "equal dignity. Meaning, since all human beings are created in God's image, each individual's identity deserves equal treatment. As God's image has no discernable human attribute, there is no basis to suggest superiority of one group over another." (Stabile 2006, 8). The lines between external and

individual acceptance of identity bleed into each other. In this philosophy, people ought to devote themselves to the care of all and each individual, because both are one of the same.

The Concept of Acceptance of Identity as it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western- Secular	Individual (internal) Intrapersonal	Horton, Bayerl, and Jacobs define intra-unit identity as values, beliefs, norms, and expectations held by a single individual or collective about who “we are” as a group in addition to who “I am” as an individual. Their review of the literature displays how acceptance or non-acceptance of identity appears at different levels e.g., organizational, group, and individual level). Research into intra-unit conflicts at the organizational level finds its roots in the work of Albert and Whetten (1985) on hybrid identities. (Horton et. Al 2014, S7).
Western- Catholic	Individual Intrapersonal	“The Church’s social doctrine begins with the recognition of the inviolable dignity of the human person, that each person regardless of race, sex, age, national origin, religion, sexual orientation, employment, health, intelligence, achievement, or any other differentiating characteristic has a dignity and is worthy of respect.” (Stabile 2006, 8).
Non- Western	Individual (internal) Structural and Societal (external)	A female respondent from the Pachir Agam district of Nangarhar, who has been displaced for almost 10 years, equates dignity with her personal identity: her own name, position, family, religion, language, etc. (Holloway et al. 2019, 4).

A notable trait of the conceptualization of acceptance of identity is how one accepts identity shifts between Western and Non-Western understandings of acceptance. This is due to differing conceptions of how humans ought to behave to each other. “When people in Western-style democracies in general regard liberalism as the cornerstone of worthy human existence, in many Asian cultures, the rights and freedoms of individuals are intertwined with their duties and roles as determined by religion or convention.” (Lee 2008, 30). Still, tools that promote acceptance of alternative identities promote both internal and external validation of identity. Self-compassion is a measure toward offering acceptance to groups and individuals outside of one’s own identity.

Inclusion

Definition

Inclusion has been defined by two notable sources in the literature. Gisellson wrote, “Inherent dignity based on an account of a common humanity within which all humans might be seen as possessing inherent worth and, therefore, deserving of being recognized and respected equally as ends in themselves” (2018). The core notion of “inherent dignity” entails a universal inclusiveness where all people are entitled to various aspects of dignity. In this instance, inclusion and dignity entails examining instances where all aspects of dignity are not universally applied to people. Additionally, the UN’s Department of Economic and Social Affairs defines inclusion “as the process of improving the terms of participation in society for people who are disadvantaged on the basis of age, sex, disability, race, ethnicity, and economic and migration status” (2016). In this sense, inclusion allows people to feel a sense of belonging at all levels of a relationship, ranging from familial to organizational and national settings.

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

Inclusion is conceptualized in both western-secular and non-western literature.

Within Western-secular literature, many of the articles found examine inclusion with regards to employment and the westernized “workplace”. The World Economic Forum published the report, “Toward Common Metrics and Consistent Reporting of Sustainable Value Creation” which sought to standardize SDG (sustainable development goal) related metrics reported by international private firms. This was done to align reporting, diminish fragmentation, and encourage swifter progress towards systemic solutions. “Diversity and Inclusion” are listed as a category in the “Dignity and Equality” portion of the group’s core metrics. This is defined here as, “Percentage of employees per employee category, by age group, gender and other indicators of diversity.” In this instance, inclusion is clearly quantifiable for westernized secular stakeholders. Similar western articles delve into ways to measure inclusion by way of examining the diversity of organizations and communities to determine how inclusive they are.

Much of the examined non-western literature delved into the trend of non-western perspectives being underrepresented in forums pertaining to dignity. In one example, Tim Murithi argues that much of the current international human rights standards are heavily westernized and not inclusive of indigenous perspectives of human rights from Africa. He argues that it is imperative for such sweeping documents on human rights and inherent dignity to be more inclusive of non-western perspectives. Another article by Alan Chong examined the work of Southeast Asian anti-colonial political writers to illustrate the importance of including non-western perspectives on democracy and dignity.

The Concept of Inclusion as it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature

Western-Secular	Intrapersonal Structural and Societal (External)	Inclusion is “the process of improving the terms of participation in society for people who are disadvantaged on the basis of age, sex, disability, race, ethnicity, and economic and migration status”(UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs). In the World Economic Forum Publication, inclusion pertains to creating communities and workplaces where diversity exists.
Non-Western	Structural and Societal (External)	“The need to open the space of dialogue on what human rights entail within the various cultural communities and sections of the human population. By virtue of the fact that these communities were marginalized by colonizing forces, they were not in a position to input and contribute towards the formulation of a global code of human rights”. (Murithi 2007)

Acknowledgement

Definition

Donna Hicks writes of acknowledgement, “Give people your full attention by listening, hearing, validating and responding to their concerns and what they have been through” (2011). This trait entails the recognition or acceptance of an event, person, or group of people. Inherently, some people and things are more readily acknowledged than others by outside groups. Oftentimes, the consequences that come with acknowledgment, including making amends for past wrongs, serve as obstacles to eventual recognition. Acknowledgement can also apply to persons. Bell writes, “Dignity is fundamental in this context to ensure that persons with disabilities are not continually cast in the role of supplicants asking for their rights to be recognized but that their rights are acknowledged as a matter of course in the same way as everyone else” (2007). Here acknowledgement, as an aspect of dignity, is not equitably given to persons with disabilities. This serves as an illustration of how a lack of acknowledgment can prevent the recognition of dignity. De Colle wrote of this recognition and “acknowledging everyone as fully human capable of body, mind, spirit, and emotion (2017).

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

Acknowledgement is conceptualized in medical, Western-secular and non-secular literature.

Within secular literature as a whole, a great deal of studies pertaining to acknowledgement were found in medicine and palliative care situations. Oftentimes, people who are entering into end-of-life treatment may feel that their physical, emotional, and spiritual needs are not acknowledged. Harvey Cochinov has conducted extensive research on the intersection of dignity and medicine. He writes, “How patients perceive themselves to be seen is a powerful mediator of their dignity” (2007). This generally culminates in how patients’ unique situation and independence are not adequately acknowledged by medical staff, family, and friends. He found

that insights of dignity in medicine are most strongly connected to feeling as a “burden to others” and “sense of being treated with respect” (2007). Thus, it is crucial that those involved in a patient’s care (including medical professionals and any visitors) acknowledge their whole personhood (rather than just their ailment) and recognize their value. If this aspect of dignity is not given, patients are likely to perceive a low level of self-worth. “Patients who feel that life no longer has worth, meaning, or purpose are more likely to feel they have become a burden to others, and patients who feel they are little more than a burden may start to question the point of their continued existence” (2007). While much of the research on dignity conserving care has been used in palliative care, it can be applied across all aspects of medicine.

Researchers study acknowledgment of a patient’s full personhood by using a variety of interview and survey instruments. These questions generally pertain to how the person believes they are perceived by medical staff and their visitors. The interview questions can be as broad and open ended as, “What do you wish for the future of the people you care about?” and “What have you learned from life you would like to tell others?” (Julião et al, 2019). Questions like these help acknowledge the whole personhood of the patient, rather than focus on their illness. There are also interview questions which are more direct in how the patient perceives their dignity. “Is there anything in the way you are being treated that is undermining your sense of dignity?” and “Do you worry about being a burden to others?” (Cochinov, 2002). Questions like these help acknowledge the whole personhood of the patient and dissuade them from diminishing their self-worth.

Survey instruments have also been extensively utilized in measuring patients’ recognition of their dignity while they are receiving medical treatment. One survey measured this in long term care facilities by asking residents whether their needs were met in being known, care and assistance, privacy, and social interactions. Survey participants were asked to respond to the frequency of medical staff speaking over residents and the availability of private spaces to discuss sensitive matters (Thompson, McArthur, & Doupe, 2016). Surveys, such as this one, help discern the level to which a patient’s personhood is acknowledged in the field of medicine.

Outside of medicine, researchers examined acknowledgement in other sectors. Within international development, for instance, Tom Wein conducted a comprehensive literature review of how dignity has manifested itself in this field (2020). While this review touches on many of the themes covered here, acknowledgement is mentioned in a survey questionnaire which asks respondents to rate how much autonomy they have and if a development organization treated them as an individual (Shapiro, 2019).

Within non-secular literature, Vincent Lloyd discusses the joining of Black politics and dignity from a Christian perspective. He examines the pervasive trait of domination, the ability to impose one’s arbitrary will over another thus dehumanizing the dominated person (Lloyd, 2018). This dehumanization reflects the dearth of acknowledgement of one’s inherent dignity. He writes how leaders in Black Politics using the language of dignity participated in or were formed in Christian communities (Lloyd, 2018). He later writes that domination, from a Christian perspective, is idolatry, which is “the machinations of the wealthy and powerful” (Lloyd, 2018). This obscures “our perception and ultimately separates us from each other and from the divine”, thus objecting

to domination entails refusal of “the ways of the world, refusing to let the world fully define who one is” (Lloyd, 2018). This refusal derived here, is what Christians articulate as the “image of God” (Lloyd, 2018). Black politics and the Christian rejection of domination are shown to be strikingly similar in their pursuit of dignity and acknowledgement.

The Concept of Acknowledgement as it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western-Secular	Individual (Internal) Intrapersonal	“Dignity is defined as the quality or state of being worthy, honored or esteemed” (Chochinov, 2002). Chochinov’s writings on dignity in medicine find that diminished acknowledgment of one’s personhood detracts from the dignity patients ascribe to themselves and how they feel perceived by others.
Non-Secular	Intrapersonal Structural and Societal (External)	Lloyd writes how systems of domination stand in the way of the acknowledgement of people’s inherent dignity. Such domination, from a Christian perspective, is idolatry, which is “the machinations of the wealthy and powerful” (Lloyd, 2018). Thus domination “separates us from the divine” and objecting this trait is a refusal of “the ways of the world” (Lloyd, 2018). This refusal is what Christians articulate as the “image of God” (Lloyd, 2018). “Struggling together against domination, we both perform dignity” (Lloyd 2018, 85)

Independence, Autonomy, and Agency

Definition

Independence, autonomy, and agency hinge on human rights enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and Constitutions that grant a human being physical, cognitive, and emotional capability to develop and execute a decision-making power to live with dignity, empowerment, and respect. There were several references of independence, autonomy and agency in the literature. Of the most notable, Formosa and Mackenzie (2014) define independence, autonomy and agency as “Feeling of control of one’s like to act on one’s behalf with a sense of hope and possibility, which leads to empowerment”. Wein as physical well-being, freedom of conscience and religious observance, as well as the ability to participate in project design, management and implementation as independent agents rather than hopeless objects (2020).

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

The categories in the literature fall into western law and human rights literature, Catholic Social Thought, international development literature focused on humanitarian work, cross-cultural literature review on human dignity, and philosophy (Kant and the Capabilities Approach Theory).

Law and human rights literature emphasize the inalienability of human rights, including autonomy, independence, and agency based on human dignity. In contrast, Catholic Social Thought explains the inalienability of human dignity as a divine high vocation to fulfill God's assignment to attain Integral Human Development. International Development literature emphasizes the principle of respectful treatment towards the beneficiaries as subject human beings and counterparts rather than objects merely capable of receiving aid. Kant claims that exercise of autonomy to cultivate emotional and cognitive abilities to act following human dignity builds achievement dignity on top of status dignity. That is, every human being has the status dignity -- the capacity for reason, rationality, and conscience, while the achievement of dignity requires cultivation. The capabilities approach theory builds on Kant's philosophy to include people with disabilities. Nussbaum argues that persons with disabilities possess status dignity since given appropriate resources, attention, and care from the earliest age, they are capable of developing cognitive and emotional capacities equal to abled persons. The cross-cultural review yielded similar definitions, based on the Arabic notion of *karāma* and African notion of *ubuntu* that emphasize self-reliance and creative power of a human being to empower oneself and one's family to live a good life.

The Concept of Independence, Autonomy, and Agency as it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western- Secular	Individual (internal) Structural Societal (Systemic, external)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The law and human rights literature focus on individual rights and structural forces that provide or violate these rights (Chong 2008; Classen 2014; Hernández 2021; Shulztiner and Carmi 2014; Skopin 2016; Venckiene 2011). International development literature similarly emphasizes respect for independence, autonomy, and agency of the beneficiaries and their human status as subjects (Wein 2020). Western philosophy emphasizes individual innate capacity for morality (Formosa and MacKenzie 2014), while Nussbaum points out systemic discrimination of the persons with disabilities to fully realize independence, autonomy, and agency to live with dignity (Hernández 2021).
Western- Catholic	Individual (internal) Structural Societal (Systemic, external)	Catholic Social Thought and Integral Human Development Theory state that God assigned a task of human dignity to humanity, which granted each human being the independence, autonomy, and agency to fulfill the assignment for the common good and each and whole person (Van Tongeren 2013).

Non- Western	Individual (internal) Structural Societal (Systemic, external)	Individual physical and cognitive well-being allows for a decision-making power to develop empowerment and self-reliance to fulfill the duties towards oneself, family, and society (Himanen 2014, Khatib 2010, Shapiro 2019, Wein 2020)
--------------	--	--

The concepts of independence, autonomy, and agency are most acute among marginalized populations, most notable persons with disabilities. Nussbaum’s capability approach emphasized the need for positive discrimination measures to establish regulatory incentives that prioritize persons with disabilities until they enjoy equal opportunities to yield the same autonomy, agency, and independence to not feel humiliated or disrespected. Similar arguments are valid towards systematically marginalized groups such as women, ethnic and religious minorities. These considerations are most relevant for international development organizations: in project design, management, and implementation, as well as evaluation.

Independence, autonomy, and agency overlap with empowerment, hence should be considered holistically. Among the tools to measure independence, physical independence and autonomy of patients with limited physical abilities are measured by healthcare professionals, while complex indicators of democratic governance and human rights violations measure legal and institutional frameworks of independence.

The most remarkable tool to measure autonomy is the Relative Autonomy Index (RAI), built on the concept of self-regulation under Self Determination Theory. The Self Determination Theory includes additional tools such as the Index of Autonomous Functioning, the General Causality Orientations Scale (GCOS) to measure the level of intrinsic motivation, and the Health Care Climate Questionnaire (HCCQ) to measure perceived autonomy support. The Motivators' Orientations Questionnaires measure the extent to which the motivators are autonomy-inducing. Potential use is to measure development practitioners' ability to engender autonomy among recipients.

Alkire (2005), Ibrahim and Alkire (2007) provide a summary of tools and indicators to measure agency. The World Bank builds a comprehensive survey tool to measure empowerment which includes an agency measure. The remaining measurement tools are the Women’s Agency Scale, with iterations from case studies in India and Egypt, the Reproductive Agency Scale, tools to measure sense of agency, self-care agency, moral agency, and internal control index.

Medium- Density Concepts

Dignity- associated concepts that are categorized as medium- density are those that have been identified by CRS as a concept that is in alignment with their conceptualization of human dignity. There are seven dignity- associated concepts that fall within the Medium- Density category. These include Humiliation, Safety, Seek Understanding, Accountability, Empowerment, Respect, and Self Esteem. The concepts identified in this section can be cited from several different

conceptualization levels as well as perspectives in the literature. Further details about these concepts can be found in **Table 3** below.

Table 3: Medium- Density Concept Matrix Summary			
Concept	Concept Description	Dignity Conceptualization Level	Perspective
Humiliation	<p>Reducing someone to a lower position in one's own eyes or others' eyes or making someone ashamed or embarrassed.</p> <p>(1) accepting a legitimate, lowly place; (2) depression, open anger or planning revenge; (3) mature differentiation; and (4) moderation (Linder 2006 in Tschudi 2008).</p> <p>Injury to self-respect by sending painful messages of subordination, rejection and exclusion (Statman 2000).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social, external • Structural, societal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Non-Western • Western-Secular
Respect	Whether people perceive themselves as being treated as individual human beings and not like animals or as instruments or objects of the will of others.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social, external • Structural, societal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Western-Secular • Non- Western
Seek Understanding	Believe that what others think matters; give them the chance to explain their perspectives, express their points of view; actively listen in order to understand them.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social, external 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Western-Secular • Non- Western
Accountability	<p>Take responsibility for your actions; if you have violated the dignity of another, apologize; make a commitment to change hurtful behaviors.</p> <p>Governments must create mechanisms of accountability for the enforcement of rights. Not only must rights be recognized in law and policy, but there must also be effective measures in place to hold governments accountable if the</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual • Structural, Societal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Western-Secular • Non- Western • Western-Catholic

	standards are not met – and for governments to hold third parties such as private sector actors accountable.		
Self Esteem	Internally held qualities that may be based on personal characteristics, attributes, or an acquired world view, including continuity of self, role preservation, legacy, maintenance of pride, hopefulness, a fighting spirit, and other qualities that maintain one’s self-respect.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Western-Secular • Non-Western
Empowerment	Helping people participate in society so that they can advocate for a better life for themselves and their families. People have a right to participate in how decisions are made regarding protection of their rights.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Structural, societal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Non- Western • Western-Catholic • Western-Secular
Safety	Put people at ease at two levels: physically, where they feel free of bodily harm; and psychologically, where they feel free of concern about being shamed or humiliated, that they feel free to speak without fear of retribution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual • Structural, societal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Western-Secular • Non-Western • Wester- Other Faith- Based • Western-Catholic

Humiliation

Definition

Humiliation is an instrument of (political) power that psychologically or physically violates honor, pride, sense of self-worth, and self-respect of an individual or a group with the intent of causing a feeling of inferiority to negate the equality in human dignity. According to Hojman and Miranda humiliation is an unfair treatment where one evaluates another as failing according to the former’s standards, which may cause anger and a desire for revenge (2018). Wein refers to humiliation as the absence of human dignity which manifests in actions such as involuntary institutionalization and medical treatment without consent towards persons with disabilities (2020). Thus humiliation is a manifestation of unfair treatment and in absence of human dignity.

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

The literature is predominantly Western-Secular with few Non-Western sources. Most sources share a historical perspective on humiliation based on violation of human rights, including crimes against humanity such as the Holocaust. Another perspective rationalizes humiliation as unfair

and prejudiced treatment injuring a person’s self-respect or a group’s shared dignity, for instance, among persons with disabilities in medical institutions, prisoners, refugees, or groups with shared concepts of dignity (e.g., religion, ethnicity, race, etc.). An interesting perspective of a Russian scholar posits humiliation as a tool to break a newly conscripted soldier’s will to coerce him to execute all orders disregarding personal moral values.

The Concept Humiliation at it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western-Secular	Social (external) Structural, Societal (systemic, external)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Humiliation is caused externally by systemic forces of discrimination such as racism and xenophobia followed by violence and denial of human rights (e.g., the right to work) ignored by police forces (Mossel and Holloway 2019) • The humiliation of victims in violent conflicts is caused by structural forces (Tschudi 2008) • Injury to self-respect based on external (social) standards (Hojman and Miranda 2018; Margalit 1996; Neuhäuser 2011; Shultziner and Rabinovici 2012) • Prejudiced and unfair treatment of the persons with disabilities in medical institutions (Wein 2020)
Non-Western	Social (external) Structural, Societal (systemic, external)	<p>Humiliation is caused externally by systems of oppression and discrimination, as seen in the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Measurement of humiliation via perceived discrimination among Chilean households (Hojman and Miranda 2018) • Humiliation as a Russian army’s strategic systemic tool to coerce Russian soldiers into complete subordination (Skopin 2016) • Bouaziz’s self-immolation in front of the governor’s office as a result of desperation and humiliation caused by corrupt police force and local authorities, rendering him unable to provide for his family and being literally and institutionally spat on (Hashemi 2013) • Systemic humiliation of the caste of untouchables in India (Thiranagama 2019)

There is a lack of available tools to measure humiliation. A key document is Zavaleta Reyes (2007), where he provides indicators for internal and external humiliation. His external humiliation scale was derived from Hartling and Luchetta (1999).

Respect

Definition

Jacobs wrote that respect is based on the view that people naturally possess dignity and value because of both their moral independence and self-determined freedom (2001). Respect is based on the ability of people to perceive themselves as being treated as individual beings with intrinsic value and not as animals, instruments, or objects serving the will of others. Jacobs further describes respect and dignity as being “symbiotic” in that the two are interdependent (2001). Respect, as an aspect of dignity, can span a wide variety of subcategories. In Griffin-Heslin’s article, she includes “Self-respect, respect for others, respect for peoples’ privacy, confidentiality, self-belief, and belief in others” (2005). Thus, respect pertains to perception value directed both at oneself and towards other people. In other words, respect is two-tiered: internal respect for self and external respect to others’ on the basis of their human dignity.

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

The literature which relates to respect has both western and non-western sources, however the majority of them come from western sources. Many of the tools from western sources applied to medicine and its use in palliative care. Dignity and the Essence of Medicine describes how patients in the medical system are in a vulnerable state where they might feel their self-respect diminish as a result of dwindling independence and respect they believe they receive from others. Griffin-Heslin argues that health practitioners must recognize the human dignity inherent to all deserves respect. She posits dignity is directly tied to interpersonal respect, and that “respect for human dignity, and that respect and dignity are symbiotic” (2005). In order to preserve and build respect, it is important to continue to treat patients as independent people rather than simply as bodies needing maintenance. In Chochinov’s writings, he describes the importance of medical staff acknowledging patients’ personhood in all interactions with them. This includes overt interactions such as formal and informal conversations and more subtle interpersonal contact, including body language. This notion of acknowledging the personhood on an interpersonal level can be applied to a variety of nonmedical situations where there is a difference in levels of authority (such as the difference between patients and medical staff members).

There are other measures of dignity, with regard to respect, from western literature that is not from a medicinal source. Jacelon’s study developed a 23-item scale used to measure attributed dignity in older adults. This tool measures self-value, behavioral respect towards oneself, and behavioral respect towards others through a variety of surveys and interviews. While this study was directed towards western adults, aspects of it have the potential to be adapted for use in alternate settings.

There are fewer nonwestern sources of literature pertaining to dignity and respect. Lee’s article outlines how various nonwestern texts, including Confucianism and Islamic, do not outright denote “human dignity” but they delve into the inherent value each person has and the respect they should be afforded. With this in mind, Lee states that “linguistic omission alone does not necessarily lead to a human dignity deficit when its spirit is shown to have been absorbed into the cultural essence” (2008). One should remove the ethnocentric lens before attempting to judge

how human dignity is being practiced elsewhere, particularly in cultures influenced by embedded religious and historical contexts” (Lee 2008). This article notes that there are numerous instances in nonwestern settings where human dignity and respect are honored but they are noted in all settings.

The Concept Respect as it Relates to the Dignity Concept		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western- Secular	Individual (internal) Social (interpersonal)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The more that healthcare providers are able to affirm the patient’s value—that is, seeing the person they are or were, rather than just the illness they have—the more likely that the patient’s sense of dignity will be upheld.” (Chochinov, 2007) • “Respect is based on the view that people, due to their moral independence and self-determined freedom, have value and dignity.” (Griffin-Heslin 2005)
Non- Western	Structural Societal (Systemic, external)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “The idea of human worthiness is not necessarily absent in Asian societies, many of which function under alternative political systems.” (Lee 2008)

Seek Understanding

Definition

“Seek first to understand, then to be understood” has been popularly attributed to Stephen Covey’s book *The Seven Habits of Highly Effective People* (1989). In his book, Covey writes how a reciprocal relationship can form between two parties if both utilize empathetic listening to genuinely understand one another. If one party first meaningfully seeks to understand the other, this may compel the second party to reciprocally listen with an open mind. From the conflict resolution community, Donna Hicks writes that understanding is an essential element of dignity. Of this theme she writes, “Believe that what others think matters; give them the chance to explain their perspectives, express their points of view; actively listen in order to understand them” (2018). Seeking to understand communicates inherent value in another party’s experiences and opinions. Believing what others think matters and allowing them to express their points of view is a form of dignity.

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

Within reviewed literature, much of the seeking to understand concept has been found in western literature within a variety of sectors. Scholars that examine the intersection of medicine and dignity stress the importance of valuing patients, especially when they feel their independence and self-worth are diminished. Chochinov outlines a number of interview questions that allow medical staff to better understand their patients and thus communicate the value of their perspective (2005).

In the international development sector, Paul Farmer described how seeking to understand can come about through accompaniment. He writes, “To accompany someone is to go somewhere with him or her, to break bread together, to be present on a journey with a beginning and an end” (2011). He goes on to describe an accompanier, the one who shares the experience with the person being accompanied, is better equipped to assist and work alongside them because of an eventual stronger understanding.

The Concept Seek Understanding as it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western-Secular	Individual (internal) Social (interpersonal)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Believe that what others think matters; give them the chance to explain their perspectives, express their points of view; actively listen in order to understand them” (Hicks, 2007) • “As such, the more that healthcare providers are able to affirm the patient’s value—that is, seeing the person they are or were, rather than just the illness they have—the more likely that the patient’s sense of dignity will be upheld.” (Chochinov, 2005)

Accountability

Definition

Accountability is the act of taking responsibility over an institutions’ or individuals’ actions. When an institution creates mechanisms for accountability, they are ensuring their policies are being appropriately enacted to suit those they serve. For example, governments create policies protecting individuals’ rights. When those rights are violated the government must enforce and protect the wronged party. When individuals take responsibility for their actions they are committing to protecting the dignity of others, and changing their behavior if they have violated others’ dignity.

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

Accountability is found in development, western and non-western governance, and catholic social teaching texts.

Dignity's place in development is deeply intertwined with accountability. For example, the Catholic Relief Service conceptualizes accountability in development as, "A commitment to balance and respond to the needs of all stakeholders (including project participants, donors, partners and the organization itself) in the activities of the project." (MEAL 2019, 3). Here accountability is practically fulfilled by maintaining transparent communication, aligning development goals with stakeholder standards, and ensuring there are channels for response and participation. Within development, accountability is structural rather than an individual or intrapersonal level. Accountability is a mechanism for institutional accompaniment. This accompaniment is aimed toward public and private bodies.

In Non-Western governance texts, accountability as a structural concept is not so explicit, but it does exist. In the Cairo declaration, for example, there is a duty of the state to protect individuals' dignity: "Every human being is entitled to inviolability and the protection of his good name and honor during his life and after his death. The state and society shall protect his remains and burial place." (Lee 2008, 22) Additionally, accountability as a form of respect is carried from the interpersonal level to the structural. Meniscus, a Confucian philosopher, said, "Treat the aged of your own family in a manner befitting their venerable age and extend this treatment to the aged of other families; treat your own young in a manner befitting their tender age and extend this to the young of other families, and you can roll the Empire on your palm." (Lee 2008, 18). Comparatively, in Western governance, accountability as a mechanism can be seen as a representative government where leaders are influenced by their constituencies. (Freedom House Index, 2015). Meaning, the accountability of leaders is governed by their stakeholders. The difference between the conceptualization appears to be emphasis of the intrapersonal level in non-Western text, accountability is translatable between individuals and structures. The Western governance texts focus on how accountability is ensured at the structural level to the public as whole. Nevertheless, accountability in Western and Non-Western governance is seen as a method of ensuring individuals' dignity is protected.

Within Catholic social teaching, dignity can be considered an internal assignment. The thinker must be accountable by thinking through what is the moral decision, rather than following laws without consideration. "You should ponder what you ought to do. Natural law is an obligation to think rather than simply obey blindly (either your natural impulses or some authority or other)." (Tongeren 2013, 154). Accountability is not structural or intrapersonal, but is seeded in individuals. And failing to be accountable, can have widespread consequences. "If people have a task to care for the earth, they can be blamed for caring badly" (Tongeren 2013, 160).

Accountability within Western-Secular literature is mainly focused on the structural/societal level. Alternatively, in the Catholic literature, accountability is an individual's duty. In non-Western literature, accountability is both structural/societal and intrapersonal.

The Concept Accountability as it Relates to Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western- Secular	Structural Societal	Accountability is an institutional mechanism aimed toward stakeholders. “Accountability is a commitment to balance and respond to the needs of all stakeholders—including project participants, donors, partners and the organization itself—in the activities of the project” - MEAL 2019, 124.
Western- Catholic	Individual	In the words of the Compendium: ‘every sin is social’, ‘each individual’s sin in some way affects others’ (117).
Non- Western	Intrapersonal Structural/Societal	Intrapersonal: “Treat the aged of your own family in a manner befitting their venerable age and extend this treatment to the aged of other families; treat your own young in a manner befitting their tender age” Structural: “Every human being is entitled to inviolability and the protection of his good name and honour during his life and after his death. The state and society shall protect his remains and burial place.” (Lee 2008, 22)

Catholic Relief Service pairs accountability with learning when conducting development work. This conceptual pairing demonstrates how accountability can be a channel to receive stakeholder response, which furthers iterations of the development project.

Self-Esteem

Definition

Self-esteem is an individual’s perception of self. Self-esteem can be influenced by personal, unique characteristics or acquired societal values. For example, perseverance is a trait that is held in high esteem, for an individual’s perceived self-dignity. To dignify others’ self-esteem, individuals must display respect in their actions that affect other individuals.

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

Within a non-Western framework, self-esteem as a concept is brought forth in refugee rights texts, in particular concerning refugee dignity. In Western texts, dignity in healthcare focuses on self-esteem.

In a study on adult Palestinian refugees' dignity, self-esteem is directly linked to self-respect. In other words, dignity of self refers to, "internally held qualities that may be based on personal characteristics, attributes, or an acquired world view, including continuity of self, role preservation, legacy, maintenance of pride, hopefulness, a fighting spirit." (Khatib 2010, 39). Self-respect and self-esteem are inseparable within this context. Thus, this specific non-Western contextualization keeps to the individual level.

Similarly, in Western studies on patient care, self-respect is intertwined with self-esteem. While self-esteem is rooted in an individual's self-regard, there is a duty for others to acknowledge the inherent dignity of human beings. In other words, these texts expand self-esteem to enter individual and intrapersonal levels. People have a duty to ensure other people's identity or self-esteem is not harmed.

Self-esteem in the Western-Secular literature is widely found on a structural/societal, intrapersonal, and individual level. Alternatively, in non-Western literature, self-esteem is described in the individual context.

The Concept Self-Esteem as it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western- Secular	Individual Intrapersonal	Individual: "The dignity of identity is tied to the integrity of the subject's body and mind, and in many instances, although not always, also dependent on the subject's self-image." (Nordenfelt 2004, 69). Intrapersonal: "Giving people activity, giving people money, raising their self-esteem . . . the rewards I saw [were] people gaining a voice and have some respect for themselves, for their own time . . . so that they were better able to give people grief when they were treated inappropriately." (Jacobson 2012, 126)
Non- Western	Individual (internal)	"Mairis identifies characteristics of dignity as the maintenance of self-respect, self-esteem, and the appreciation of individual standards (Mairis 1994). The fourth theme is self-esteem. This theme appeared in the work of Chochinov et al. (1982), where they state that dignity refers to internally held qualities that may be based on personal characteristics, attributes, or an acquired world view, including continuity of self, role preservation, legacy, maintenance of pride, hopefulness, a fighting spirit, and other qualities that maintain one's self-respect." (Khatib 2010, 39)

There is a myriad of tools that can identify and bolster self-esteem. These tools are developed by psychologists and applied by therapists to empower patients. Notable tools include: The Self-Perception Profile for Children (SPPC), Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale, and the Coopersmith Self-Esteem Inventory.

Empowerment

Definition

There are several notable definitions of empowerment in the literature. Wein states that empowerment relies on the political processes required to realize and claim respectful treatment, quality and dignity (2020). Additionally, Griffin- Heslin (2005) and Jacobson (2012) describe that empowerment promotes dignity by reframing people’s understanding of the world and of themselves. As such, it changes their perspectives and raises their expectations to result in increased self- esteem, modesty, pride and self-worthiness (Griffin- Heslin (2005) and Jacobson (2021)). Empowerment is a combination of political, economic, and social processes that grows a person’s or a group’s sense of dignity (e.g., self-worth), engendering the person’s or the group’s capacities to claim the lifestyles consistent with human dignity (e.g., human rights, gender equality, and welfare).

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

Literature reviews the circumstances of the disempowered and examines the conditions necessary for empowerment and the subsequent promotion of human dignity. The settings vary from international development (e.g., gender inequality, displacement, indigenous communities) to health and human rights (e.g., nursing, disabilities, older people, and end-of-life care).

The Concept Empowerment as it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western- Secular	Structural, Societal (Systemic, external)	The political and economic structures affecting the power relations and the placement of the given person or a group on an empowerment scale (Bell 2017; Hartnell 2018; IHRB 2019; Mea and Sims 2016; Mattson and Clark 2011; Pirson et al. 2019; Wein 2020)
Western- Secular	Individual (internal)	Improvement in self-worth and self-esteem, raising expectations and reframing personal worldview resulting in local individual action to enhance capacities, capabilities, and competencies (Griffin-Heslin 2005, Jacobson 2009; Jacobson 2012)
Non-Western	Structural, Societal (Systemic, external)	The political, economic, and social structures replicating colonial power relations in

		international development (Hartnell 2018; Holloway et al. 2018; Holloway et al. 2019; Pirson et al. 2019; Pless and Appel 2012; Short 2019; Wein 2020)
--	--	--

The majority of tools to measure empowerment are related to women’s empowerment and deeply intertwined with agency and autonomy, the high-ranked concepts. There is a need to consider empowerment, independence, agency, and autonomy holistically to develop a framework or build a tool. The Overseas Development Institute (ODI), Ipsos Global Affairs, and the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation provide a comprehensive framework for the indicators in women’s empowerment, which would prove to be a beneficial background to review existing indicators and build a new tool. Other documents include lists of existing indicators, M&E tools, and scales in women’s empowerment.

Political empowerment includes enabling democratic institutions, which world governance indicators measure, including the “Voice and accountability” indicator. There is room to adjust the indicators to the project scale -- to measure if and how the project empowered beneficiaries to participate. The instruments under a high-ranked concept of the agency include a tool to measure how enabling the individuals in the position of authority are in engendering autonomy, which is also relevant to measuring empowerment.

Low- Density, but Important, Concepts

Dignity- associated concepts that are categorized as low- density are those that have been identified by CRS as a concept that is in alignment with their conceptualization of human dignity. There are seven dignity- associated themes that include Self- Reliance, Transparency and Communication, and Opportunity. The concepts identified in this section can be cited from several different conceptualization levels as well as perspectives in the literature. Further details about these concepts can be found in the summary table below.

Table 4: Low- Density Concept Matrix Summary			
Concept	Concept Description	Dignity Conceptualization Level	Perspective
Transparency and Communication	Perception of fairness and openness around targeting criteria and how aid allocation decisions are made.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Structural, societal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Western- Secular
Opportunity	The ability of a state to provide economic opportunities for its citizens, which can be measured with economic factors.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Structural, societal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Western- Secular

Self- Reliance	Dignity is also correlated to older people’s ability to maintain self-reliance. The following passage in a WHO (2002, p. 37) document is particularly significant, the respect of the dignity of older people is associated with the restraint from unnecessary intervention: “Professional caregivers need to respect older people’s dignity at all times and to be careful to avoid premature interventions that may unintentionally induce the loss of independence” (Paoletti 2017).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Western-Secular
----------------	--	--	---

Transparency and Communication

Definition

Transparency and communication is the act of creating an environment of fairness by openly sharing goals and progress. Transparency and communication can be bolstered by a mechanism for two-way communication between stakeholders and institutions. In development work, transparency and communication can mean providing stakeholders with targeting criteria and explaining how aid allocation decisions are made. Transparency and communication are important tools to disseminate decision-making processes, especially when an institutions’ decisions affect people’s livelihood and rights.

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

Within human rights and humanitarian work, transparency and communication is an act that promotes beneficiaries’ dignity. Societal transparency between persons and institutions, including governments, signals that individuals’ dignity is valued. A lack of transparency and communication can reflect endemic inequalities and exacerbate disenfranchisement between individuals and institutions. (Al-Rodhan 2016, 8). In interviews with internally displaced persons receiving aid, they noted a “dignified response included transparency, clear targeting, and face-to-face communication.” (Mosel and Holloway 2019, vi). When institutions fail to disclose their decision making practices and targets, they run the risk of disenfranchising their recipients. For example, in an aid dissemination project in Afghanistan, a lack of “communication and transparency around which part of the population is chosen to receive aid and how that decision is made led to allegations of corruption against the Maliks, or community leaders, who are often in charge of distributing aid.” (Mosel and Holloway 2019, 10). To be transparent, institutions must have a clear grievance and two-way communication mechanism, as well as, offer responses to show that the institution is comprehending what their stakeholders are communicating.

Additionally, transparency and communication is recognized as a method toward maintaining patients dignity in care literature. In particular, communication is a defining attribute of patient dignity. In a nursing analysis of the concept dignity communication is defined as “timegiving, explaining information, understanding information, comfort, non-verbal and verbal

communication.” (Griffin-Heslin 2005, 254). Transparency and communication provides patients with autonomy and choice, which honors their dignity.

The Concept Transparency and Communication as it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western-Secular	Structural, Societal (systemic, external)	“The key ingredients of an effective and dignified humanitarian response – one that is open, transparent, fair, respectful and accountable to local populations. When it comes to dignity, what aid was delivered and who delivered it seemed to matter less to people than how that aid was given. an outcome where all capacities at all levels – local, national, regional, international – are harnessed and combined in a way that supports the best humanitarian outcomes for affected populations’...Rather than focusing on labels that in practice may not mean much, amore effective and dignified response is one that draws on each organizations’ strengths.”(Mosel and Holloway 2019, 18-19)

Transparency and communication mechanisms are common within the policy and humanitarian aid realm, most institutions offer a system for communication. Some organizations apply dialouge maps that offer pathways to receive and disseminate information. Other organizations create anonymous reporting tools that provide individuals with a method to respond to an institution without redress.

Opportunity

Definition

A few definitions of opportunity were identified in the literature. The primary example is from Al-Rodhan. In this definition, opportunity is defined as the ability of a state to provide economic opportunities for its citizens to move upwards the socioeconomic mobility scale regardless of individual circumstances (Al-Rodhan, 2016).

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

Al-Rodhan (2016) included the indicator of economic opportunity in his proposed dignity scale for sustainable governance, which served as the foundation for the inclusion of this concept. Other sources include socio-demographic circumstances to define and measure opportunity, including gender, wealth, location, and legislation.

The Concept Opportunity as it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western- Secular	Structural, Societal (Systemic, external)	Structural inhibitors of opportunity such as socioeconomic inequalities (e.g., structural racism, gender inequality, wealth gap) and structural enablers (legislation) shape access to opportunity (Al-Rodhan 2016; Economic Intelligence Unit 2010; N26 2021; Opportunity Nation 2011; Vega et al 2011)

Al-Rodhan (2016) proposed the “Economic Decline” indicator from the Fragile States Indicator (then Failed States Index) to measure economic opportunity among countries. The indicator evaluates per capita income, Gross National Product, unemployment rates, inflation, productivity, debt, poverty levels, or business failures, among other economic measures.

Opportunity Index by Opportunity Nation summarizes statistics on opportunity across Economy, Education, Health, and Community at the state and county level in the U.S. Each dimension includes three to seven indicators—the specific measurements used to quantify opportunity. Despite the U.S. context, the methodology can be customized to fit other locations, given there is access to data. The Human Opportunity Index (HOI) measures how individual circumstances (i.e., characteristics—such as place of residence, gender, and education of the household head—that should not determine access to basic goods and services) can affect a child’s access to basic opportunities such as water, education, electricity, and sanitation. Women’s economic opportunity index by the Economist Intelligence Unit and N26 provides a measurement of economic opportunities for women, which could also be of use in developing a framework for measuring human dignity.

Self-Reliance

Definition

“The abundance of opportunities (work & ease of receiving asylum) to reach self-sufficiency -- the ability to provide for themselves -- in order to restore dignity determines the humanitarian migrants' choice in destinations” (Holland, Peters, and Sanchez 2020). Self-reliance is a trait where an individual, group or community has the ability to support itself without any external assistance. This independence from outside support is a key aspect of this characteristic because freedom from reliance diminishes the likelihood of an uneven power dynamic between two parties. In the event one party is reliant on a second party then the first party is inherently beholden to the other thus introducing a potentially explosive situation. Freedom from limiting power dynamics ultimately provides dignity in the form of self-determination.

Description of the Literature that Uses this Concept

A strong majority of the literature pertaining to self-reliance and dignity comes from western-secular publications. Much of it pertains to displaced persons and how they can retain their independence despite being in situations where they must rely on others. One study of 1400 Iraqi and Syrian humanitarian migrants compared their preferred European destinations to find their preferences for where they settled (Holland, Peters, and Sanchez 2020). They ultimately found that migrants tied work to their own sense of dignity because they prioritized opportunities for employment over other expected concerns including welfare benefits, and ease of asylum (Holland, Peters, and Sanchez 2020). This demonstrates the importance of self-reliance in conversations about dignity.

Another publication, *Dignity and Humanitarian Action in Displacement*, mentions the significance of “ensuring that affected communities retain a sense of safety and control of access to resources, information and decision-making” (Holloway and Mosel 2019). Here, self-determination is shown as an important part of a community’s ability to retain dignity. Allowing community members to make decisions lets them fully assess the choices before them and gives them full accountability. This self-determination is linked to self-reliance in that the vital decision-making roles are kept within a community thus disrupting an instance where the community is dependent on an outside individual or organization.

The Concept Self-Reliance as it Relates to the Dignity Matrix		
Literature Perspective	Conceptualization Level	Evidence from the Literature
Western- Secular	Individual (internal) Social (Interpersonal, external) Structural, Societal	<p>“The abundance of opportunities (work & ease of receiving asylum) to reach self-sufficiency -- the ability to provide for themselves -- in order to restore dignity determines the humanitarian migrants' choice in destinations” (Holland, Peters, and Sanchez 2020).</p> <p>Self-determination and dignity in humanitarian response is ensuring that affected communities retain a sense of safety and control of access to resources, information and decision-making. At a minimum, this means being able to hold space for people to voice their needs and aspirations” (Holloway and Mosel 2019).</p>

MEASUREMENT TOOL MATRIX

In addition to definitions, a literature review was conducted for tools to measure the high-density dignity- associated concept. These tools were again categorized using a matrix to determine if there was an aggregation of data around particular tools for the conceptualization of respect for human dignity in practice. The matrix categorizes each of the identified articles based on association to one or more dignity- associated concepts, the tool type, and the purpose of the tool. Additionally, other descriptive details were noted such as qualitative versus quantitative measures, self-versus observed and general versus specific to name a few. The summary of the tool matrix can be found below in **Table 5** below, and a comprehensive list of these tools and corresponding description and citations are found in **Appendix A**.

Table 5: Tools for Measuring High-Density Concepts	
Dignity-Associated Concepts	Tool Resources
Acceptance of Identity	An Identity-Based Model of Culture in Action
	Identity Conflicts at Work: An Interactive Framework
	Reconciling the advantages and liabilities of foreignness: An identity-based framework
	Identity and Diversity Toolbox
Accountability	Increasing Strategic Accountability: A Framework for International NGOs
	Measuring social accountability in health professional education: Development and international pilot testing of an evaluation framework
Acknowledgement	Measurement of respect of human dignity in international development
	The A, B, C, and D of dignity in conserving care
	Model of Dignity and Dignity-Conserving interventions for Patients Nearing Death
	Dignity Therapy
Humiliation	Scale of Internal and External Humiliation
Inclusion	Core Metrics for Dignity and Equality
	Questions for Discussion on Leadership
	Workplace Dignity Scale
Independence, Autonomy, and Agency	Autonomy, dignity, trust index & Dignity index
	Relative Autonomy Index
	Index of Autonomous Functioning
	The Motivators' Orientations Questionnaires
	Tools for measuring agency
	World Bank's survey to measure empowerment
Respect	Developing an Instrument for Measuring Human Dignity and its Relationship to Health
	Workplace Dignity Scale
	Measurement of respect of human dignity in international development

	Dignity and the Health Related Quality of Life
	Dignity Index
	Development and Validation of the Workplace Dignity Scale
Seek Understanding	Development of the Attributed Dignity Scale
	Tools for seeking understanding from the medicine field
Safety	Danger Assessment in violent relationships
	Safety climate, attitudes, satisfaction with safety status, risk perception and behaviour
	Physical Safety and Security: A Proposal for Internationally Comparable Indicators of Violence
	Psychological security of urban residents
Self Esteem	Coopersmith Self-Esteem Inventory
	Improved representation of the self-perception profile for children through bifactor exploratory structural equation modeling
	Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale
Self-Reliance	Migrants' Destination Preferences
	Dignity in Displacement - Personal and community needs
Transparency and Communication	A dialogue map of leader and leadership development methods: A communication tool
	Transparency in Corporate Reporting
	Interactive Web Tools in Environmental Planning to Improve Communication about Sustainable Development

KEY SUMMARY POINTS NEXT STEPS

Summary Points

The objective of the literature review process was to identify existing definitions of human dignity and determine instances when human dignity was measured. Through the review of the medical literature, human rights and law, and international development literature multiple perspectives and definitions of several dignity- associated concepts were identified. The dignity matrix served as a process to categorize each of the identified articles based on perspective type, document summary, dignity conceptualization level, dignity associated concepts, and other bibliographic details. Overall findings indicate that the majority of dignity- associated concepts have some level of description in the literature from the Western- Secular perspective regardless of which dignity- conceptualization level they are associated with. Additionally, the majority of dignity- associated concepts identified are noted in the literature from the Western perspective. This is in part due to the limitation of language of the literature explored. To address this, the team is engaging with faculty at the Ansari Institute for Global Religion to expand understanding of non-Western perspectives of dignity. Lastly, all dignity- associated concepts reviewed had more than one perspective and more than one conceptualization level in the literature on average.

Next Steps

Following the literature process of identifying definitions for each concept, a second literature review process was completed to identify tools or measurements for each dignity- associated concept. A series of tools were identified that provided a framework for measuring dignity more broadly. Additionally, tools that either measure dignity or assess the dignity- associated concept were identified. To actualize the definitions and summarize a framework for measures of dignity, the University of Notre Dame team will work towards the following:

- Hold a series of workshops with CRS to review findings of the literature process and to discuss tools
- Work collaboratively with the CRS team to identify the most applicable tools for both assessing and measuring affirmations of dignity as it aligns with their work.
- Build on existing tools to generate items to include in a dignity affirmation tool
- Pilot the application of this tool through field testing in one or more of CRS's active projects.
- Expand the literature review to encompass more faith traditions and languages.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This document was made possible by the generous support of the GHR Foundation and through a partnership with Catholic Relief Services. This report was produced by Paul Perrin, Jenna Wozniak, Sam Morris, Zhanayim Kozybay, Anna Lande, and Angelina Soriano Nuncio with the Pulte Institute for Global Development at the University of Notre Dame, with substantive input and review from Tony Castleman and John Hembling at Catholic Relief Services. The contents of this document are the sole responsibility of the authors and do not necessarily represent the views of their respective organizations.

WORKS CITED

- . *Human Rights for Human Dignity A Primer on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights* . 2014. London: Amnesty International Publications.
- "Welcome to the Dark Side of Dignity and Development." 2017. In *Birth of a New Earth*: Columbia University Press.
- Abbott, Libby, Brittney Bailey, Yuka Karasawa, Dorothy Louis, Shanon Mcnab, Dohini Patel, Carolina Posada López, et al. 2011. *Evaluation of UNFPA's Provision of Dignity Kits in Humanitarian and Post- Crisis Settings Client: United Nations Populations Fund*.
- Aguado, Ricardo, Leire Alcañiz, and José Luis Retolaza. 2015. "A New Role for the Firm Incorporating Sustainability and Human Dignity. Conceptualization and Measurement." *Human Systems Management* 34 (1): 43-56. doi:10.3233/HSM-150829. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/1687814172>.
- Al-Abdullah, Rania. 2003. *Human Dignity and Humanitarian Space*. Geneva: ICRC.
- Al-Rodhan, Nayef. 2016. *Proposal of a Dignity Scale for Sustainable Governance* University of Oxford.
- Anh Duong, Kim and Rachel Simon-Kumar. 2017. "Dignity and Human Trafficking Policy in Vietnam: Deconstructing Gender." In *Human Dignity*, 159-178. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK. doi:10.1057/978-1-137-56005-6_10. http://link.springer.com/10.1057/978-1-137-56005-6_10.
- Argüello Parra, Andrés and Priscyll Ancil Avoine. 2017. "From "Polymorphism of Violence" to the Complexities of Peace: Towards an Integral Dignity in Colombia." In *Human Dignity*, 231-245. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK. doi:10.1057/978-1-137-56005-6_14. http://link.springer.com/10.1057/978-1-137-56005-6_14.
- Batniji, Rajaie. 2012. "Searching for Dignity." *The Lancet* 380 (9840): 466-467.
- Bayefsky, Rachel. 2014. "Dignity as a Value in Agency Cost-Benefit Analysis." *The Yale Law Journal* 123 (6): 1732-1782. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23745031>.
- Beaumont, Leland R. "Dignity Index - A Developing Proposal." *emotionalcompetency.com*., accessed March 5, 2021, <http://www.emotionalcompetency.com/hdi/#:~:text=The%20HDHS%20network%20has%20assembled,and%20destructive%20throughout%20the%20world>.
- Beitz, Charles R. 2013. "Human Dignity in the Theory of Human Rights: Nothing but a Phrase?" *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 41 (3): 259-290. <http://www.jstor.org.proxy.library.nd.edu/stable/42703857>.

- Bell, Sylvia. 2017. "Dignity and Disability." In *Human Dignity*, 37-52. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK. doi:10.1057/978-1-137-56005-6_3. http://link.springer.com/10.1057/978-1-137-56005-6_3.
- Bernardini, Paola. 2010. "Human Dignity and Human Capabilities in Martha C. Nussbaum." *Iustum Aequum Salutare* 6 (4): 45-52. <https://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?handle=hein.journals/iaesal6&div=56&id=&page=>.
- Bradley, Megan. 2007. *Return in Dignity: A Neglected Protection Challenge*. Oxford, UK.
- Brooks, Jeff. 2008. "Dignity Vs. Humanity." *FundRaising Success*.
- Cairns, Edmund and Naomi Meneghini-Relf. 2015. *For Human Dignity - the World Humanitarian Summit: The Challenge to Deliver*. Oxford.
- Camargo, Blanca A. and Mario Vázquez-Maguirre. 2021. "Humanism, Dignity and Indigenous Justice: The Mayan Train Megaproject, Mexico." *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 29 (2-3): 372-391. doi:10.1080/09669582.2020.1758707. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09669582.2020.1758707>.
- Carozza, Paolo G. 2013. "Human Rights, Human Dignity, and Human Experience." In *Understanding Human Dignity*, edited by Christopher McCrudden. First ed., 615-629. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Caselles, Antonio. 2015. *Trying to Evaluate Human Dignity in a Social Group*. Vol. 15.
- Chochinov, Harvey Max. 2007. "Dignity and the Essence of Medicine." *The British Medical Journal* 335: 184-187. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1934489/pdf/bmj-335-7612-ac-00184.pdf>.
- . 2002. "Dignity-Conserving Care--a New Model for Palliative Care: Helping the Patient Feel Valued." *Journal of the American Medical Association* 287 (17): 2253-2260. doi:10.1001/jama.287.17.2253. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/11980525/>.
- Chochinov, Harvey Max, Thomas Hassard, Susan McClement, Thomas Hack, Linda J. Kristjanson, Mike Harlos, Shane Sinclair, and Alison Murray. 2008. "The Patient Dignity Inventory: A Novel Way of Measuring Dignity-Related Distress in Palliative Care." *Journal of Pain and Symptom Management* 36 (6): 559-571.
- Chong, Alan. 2008. "Asian Contributions on Democratic Dignity and Responsibility: Rizal, Sukarno and Lee on Guided Democracy." *East Asia : An International Quarterly* 25 (3). <https://www.proquest.com/politicalscience/docview/215887615/EC23450EE66B408APQ/45?accountid=6112874>.

- Claassen, Rutger. 2014. "Human Dignity in the Capability Approach." In *The Cambridge Handbook of Human Dignity*, 240-249: Cambridge University Press.
doi:10.1017/CBO9780511979033.030.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511979033.030>.
- Cornell, Drucilla and Nick Friedman. 2016. "Dignity and Responsibility in South African Law." In *The Mandate of Dignity*, 106-111. New York, USA: Fordham University Press.
- David J. Mattson and Susan G. Clark. 2011. "Human Dignity in Concept and Practice." *Policy Sciences* 44 (4): 303-319. doi:10.1007/s11077-010-9124-0.
<https://www.jstor.org/stable/41486845>.
- de Colle, Simone, R. Edward Freeman, Bidhan Parmar, and Leonardo de Colle. 2017. "Practicing Human Dignity: Ethical Lessons from Commedia Dell'Arte and Theater." *Journal of Business Ethics* 144 (2): 251-262.
<https://www.proquest.com/politicalscience/docview/1929679889/abstract/2F66ECB494354DC1PQ/60?accountid==12874>.
- Donnelly, Jack. 2009. "Human Dignity and Human Rights." ———. 1982. "Human Rights and Human Dignity: An Analytic Critique of Non-Western Conceptions of Human Rights." *The American Political Science Review* 76 (2): 303-316. doi:10.1017/S0003055400187015. <https://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0003055400187015>.
- Espinoza, Manuel Luis, Shirin Vossoughi, Mike Rose, and Luis E. Poza. 2020. "Matters of Participation: Notes on the Study of Dignity and Learning." *Mind, Culture and Activity* 27 (4): 325-347. doi:10.1080/10749039.2020.1779304.
<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/10749039.2020.1779304>.
- Farmer, Paul. 2011. "Partners in Help: Assisting the Poor Over the Long Term." *Foreign Affairs* (July 29).
- Fernández-Sola, Cayetano, María Mar Díaz Cortés, José Manuel Hernández-Padilla, Cayetano José Aranda Torres, José María Muñoz Terrón, and José Granero-Molina. 2017. "Defining Dignity in End-of-Life Care in the Emergency Department." *Nursing Ethics* 24 (1): 20-32. doi:10.1177/0969733015604685.
<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/0969733015604685>.
- Foster, Charles. 2012. "Putting Dignity to Work." *The Lancet* 379 (9831): 2044-2045.
- Freeman, Michael D. A. 2010. "Upholding the Dignity and Best Interests of Children: International Law and the Corporal Punishment of Children." *Law and Contemporary Problems* 73 (2): 211-251. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25766392>.

- Frevort, Ute. "The History of Humiliation Points to the Future of Human Dignity | Psyche Ideas." *Psyche.*, accessed Mar 29, 2021, <https://psyche.co/ideas/the-history-of-humiliation-points-to-the-future-of-human-dignity>.
- García-Berrio Hernández, Teresa. 2021. "We are all Vulnerable — Human Capability, Corporeality and Dignity: Functional Diversity Examined in the Light of Martha C. Nussbaum's Commitment to Justice." *Challenges to Legal Theory*. doi:10.1163/9789004439450_017.
- Giselsson, Kristi. 2018. "Rethinking Dignity." *Human Rights Review* Vol. 19 (Iss. 3): 331-348. <https://search-proquest-com.proxy.library.nd.edu/politicalscience/docview/2009849691/62DF98E80A9E4CEEPQ/7?accountid=12874>.
- Griffin-Heslin, Vanessa Lynne. 2005. "An Analysis of the Concept Dignity." *Accident and Emergency Nursing* 13 (4): 251-257.
- Harrison, Oliver. 2019. "From Dignity to Self-Realisation: Rethinking Holloway's Emancipatory Theory." *Capitalism, Nature, Socialism* 30 (3): 52-69. doi:10.1080/10455752.2018.1481120. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/10455752.2018.1481120>.
- Hartnell, Caroline. 2018. *Dignity and Development*.
- Harvey Max Chochinov, Thomas Hack, Thomas Hassard, Linda J. Kristjanson, Susan McClement, and Mike Harlos. 2005. "Dignity Therapy: A Novel Psychotherapeutic Intervention for Patients Near the End of Life." *Journal of Clinical Oncology* 23 (24): 5520-5525. doi:10.1200/JCO.2005.08.391. <http://jco.ascopubs.org/content/23/24/5520.abstract>.
- Hashemi, Nader. 2013. "The Arab Spring Two Years on: Reflections on Dignity, Democracy, and Devotion." *Ethics & International Affairs* 27 (2): 207-221. <https://search-proquest-com.proxy.library.nd.edu/politicalscience/docview/1357123776/147B31D61331407DPQ/7?accountid=12874>.
- Hicks, Donna. 2016. "A Matter of Dignity: Building Human Relationships." In *Dignity Matters: Psychoanalytic and Psychosocial Perspectives*, edited by Susan S. Levine, 21-49. London: Routledge.
- . 2018. "Resolve Current and Future Conflicts with Dignity." In , 163-174: Yale University Press.
- Hojman, Daniel A. and Álvaro Miranda. 2018. "Agency, Human Dignity, and Subjective Well-Being." *World Development* 101: 1-15. doi:10.1016/j.worlddev.2017.07.029. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2017.07.029>.

- Holland, Alisha, Margaret Peters, and Thania Sanchez. "The Dignity of Humanitarian Migrants: Explaining Migrants' Destination Preferences."
- Holloway, Kerrie, Gloria Miranda Ángel, Maria Carmen (Ica) Fernandez, Wali Mohammad Kandiwal, and Leben Moro. 2019. *Dignity in Displacement Case Studies from Afghanistan, Colombia, the Philippines and South Sudan HPG Working Paper*. London: Overseas Development Institute.
- Holloway, Kerrie and Francesca Grandi. 2018. *Dignity in Displacement: A Review of the Literature*. London: Overseas Development Institute.
- Houmann, Lise J., Susan Rydahl-Hansen, Harvey M. Chochinov, Linda J. Kristjanson, and Mogens Groenvold. 2010. "Testing the Feasibility of the Dignity Therapy Interview: Adaptation for the Danish Culture." *BMC Palliative Care* 9 (1): 21. doi:10.1186/1472-684X-9-21. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20860786>.
- Institute for Human Rights and Business. 2019. *Principles for Dignity in the Built Environment A Roadmap for Human Rights DRAFT Principles for Dignity in the Built Environment*.
- International Labour Office. 2019. *Universal Social Protection for Human Dignity, Social Justice and Sustainable Development*. Geneva.
- Isa, Felipe Gómez. 2014. "Cultural Diversity, Legal Pluralism, and Human Rights from an Indigenous Perspective: The Approach by the Colombian Constitutional Court and the Inter-American Court of Human Rights." *Human Rights Quarterly* 36 (4): 722-978. <https://search-proquest-com.proxy.library.nd.edu/politicalscience/docview/1625138051/86BE57E589C4302PQ/10?accountid=12874>.
- Jacelon, Cynthia S., Jane Dixon, and Kathleen A. Knafl. 2009. "Development of the Attributed Dignity Scale." *Research in Gerontological Nursing* 2 (3): 202-213. doi:10.3928/19404921-20090421-03. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20078010>.
- Jacobson, Nora. 2012. "Dignity Promotion: The Ordinary Language of Respect." In *Dignity and Health*, 119-156. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press.
- . 2009. "A Taxonomy of Dignity: A Grounded Theory Study." *BMC International Health and Human Rights* 9 (1): 3. doi:10.1186/1472-698X-9-3. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19239684>.
- Jonathan Glennie. 2015. "The Saddest Thing in the World is Not Poverty; it's Loss of Dignity." *The Guardian*, January.
- Julião, Miguel, Bárbara Antunes, Ana Santos, Maria Ana Sobral, Sara Albuquerque, Filipa Fareleira, Daniela Runa, et al. 2019. "Adapting the Portuguese Dignity Question

Framework for Adolescents: Ages 10–18." *Palliative and Supportive Care* 18 (2). doi:10.1017/s1478951519000798. <https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/palliative-and-supportive-care/article/abs/adapting-the-portuguese-dignity-question-framework-for-adolescents-ages-1018/588E1552143BBB55CE01755CF27D45F9>.

Kayess, Rosemary and Ben Fogarty. 2007. "The Rights and Dignity of Persons with Disabilities: A United Nations Convention." *Alternative Law Journal* 32 (1). <https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1037969X0703200108>.

Khan, Maliha, Madhu Deshmukh, Catherine Toth, Emily Pelton, Kirsten Tagami, Stephanie Libby, and Julie Bernstein. 2010. *Strong Women, Strong Communities CARE's Holistic Approach to Empowering Women and Girls in the Fight Against Poverty*.

Khatib, Rasha and Haroutune Armenian. 2010. "Developing an Instrument for Measuring Human Dignity and its Relationship to Health in Palestinian Refugees." *World Medical and Health Policy* 2 (2): 35-49. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.2202/1948-4682.1077>. <http://proxy.library.nd.edu/login?url=https://www-proquest-com.proxy.library.nd.edu/scholarly-journals/developing-instrument-measuring-human-dignity/docview/837450806/se-2?accountid=12874>.

Koehn, Daryl and Alicia Leung. "Dignity in Western Versus in Chinese Cultures: Theoretical Overview and Practical Illustrations." *Business and Society Review* 113 (4): 477-504.

Le, Nhina. 2016. "Are Human Rights Universal Or Culturally Relative?" *Peace Review* 28 (2): 203. <https://www.proquest.com/politicalscience/docview/1797252825/EC23450EE66B408APQ/41?accountid=61;12874>.

Lee, Hyeon Jung. 2014. "Fearless Love, Death for Dignity: Female Suicide and Gendered Subjectivity in Rural North China." *The China Journal* (71): 25-304.

Lee, Man Yee Karen. 2008. "Universal Human Dignity: Some Reflections in the Asian Context," *Asian Journal of Comparative Law* 3: 1-33. doi:10.1017/S2194607800000211.

Li, Yong. 2019. "Virtues and Human Dignity." *International Philosophical Quarterly* 59 (2): 175-192. doi:10.5840/ipq2019227126. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/2235023258>.

Lloyd, Vincent. 2018. "Black Dignity." *CrossCurrents* 68 (1): 73-92. doi:10.2307/26642411. <https://www-jstor-org.proxy.library.nd.edu/stable/26642411>.

LO, Pilgrim W. K. 2009. "Human Dignity—A Theological and Confucian Discussion." *Dialog* 48 (2): 168-178. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-6385.2009.00452.x>. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-6385.2009.00452.x>.

Manthorpe, Jill. 2009. "Assessing Dignity in Care." *Community Care*, 30-31.

- May, James R. and Erin Daly. 2020. "The Role of Human Dignity in Achieving the UN Sustainable Development Goals." *International Environmental Law-Making and Diplomacy Review*. <https://ssrn.com/abstract=3661025>.
- Mea, William J. and Ronald R. Sims. 2019. *Human Dignity-Centered Business Ethics: A Conceptual Framework for Business Leaders*. Vol. 160 Springer Science and Business Media LLC. doi:10.1007/s10551-018-3929-8.
- Melton, Gary B. 1991. "Preserving the Dignity of Children Around the World: The U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child." *Child Abuse & Neglect* 15 (4): 343-350. doi:10.1016/0145-2134(91)90019-A. [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0145-2134\(91\)90019-A](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0145-2134(91)90019-A).
- Metz, Thaddeus. 2011. "Ubuntu as a Moral Theory and Human Rights in South Africa." *African Human Rights Law Journal* 11 (2): 532-559. http://reference.sabinet.co.za/sa_epublication_article/ju_ahrlj_v11_n2_a11.
- Metz, Thaddeus and Thaddeus Metz. 2012. "African Conceptions of Human Dignity: Vitality and Community as the Ground of Human Rights." *Human Rights Review (Piscataway, N.J.)* 13 (1): 19-37. doi:10.1007/s12142-011-0200-4. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/922510945>.
- Mosel, Irina and Kerrie Holloway. 2019. *Dignity and Humanitarian Action in Displacement*. London: Overseas Development Institute.
- Murithi, Tim. 2007. "A Local Response to the Global Human Rights Standard: The Ubuntu Perspective on Human Dignity." *Globalisation, Societies and Education* 5 (3): 277-286. doi:10.1080/14767720701661966.
- Neuhäuser, Christian. 2011. "Humiliation: The Collective Dimension." In *Humiliation, Degradation, Dehumanization: Human Dignity Violated*, edited by Paulus Kaufmann, Hannes Kuch, Christian Neuhaeuser and Elaine Webster, 21-36. Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands. doi:10.1007/978-90-481-9661-6_3. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-90-481-9661-6_3.
- Nicola M. Pless and Jenny Appel. 2012. "In Pursuit of Dignity and Social Justice: Changing Lives through 100 % Inclusion—How Gram Vikas Fosters Sustainable Rural Development." *Journal of Business Ethics* 111 (3): 389-411. doi:10.1007/s10551-012-1415-2. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23325675>.
- Nikolayenko, Olena. 2020. "The Significance of Human Dignity for Social Movements: Mass Mobilisation in Ukraine." *East European Politics* 36 (3): 445-462. doi:10.1080/21599165.2020.1757444. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/21599165.2020.1757444>.

- Nordenfelt, Lennart. 2004. "The Varieties of Dignity." *Health Care Analysis* 12 (2): 69-81. doi:10.1023/B:HCAN.0000041183.78435.4b. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/15487812/>.
- Paoletti, Isabella. 2017. "Dignity and the Fourth Age." In *Human Dignity*, 61-81. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK. doi:10.1057/978-1-137-56005-6_5. http://link.springer.com/10.1057/978-1-137-56005-6_5.
- Paul Formosa and Catriona Mackenzie. 2014. "Nussbaum, Kant, and the Capabilities Approach to Dignity." *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice* 17 (5): 875-892. doi:10.1007/s10677-014-9487-y. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/24478719>.
- Pely, Doron and David Shimoni. 2019. "The Culture of Interest: A Proposed Addition and Revision of the Three- Culture Model." *Negotiation Journal* 35 (2): 247-268. <https://www.proquest.com/politicalscience/docview/2230822588/EC23450EE66B408APQ/13?accountid=61;12874>.
- Pinard, Michael. 2010. "Collateral Consequences of Criminal Convictions: Confronting Issues of Race and Dignity." *New York University Law Review* 85 (2): 457-534.
- Pirner, Manfred L. 2019. "Striking the Right Balance for Human Dignity and Social Cohesion: Public Liberal Education between Common Values and Disparate Worldviews." *Religious Education* 114 (4): 451-456. doi:10.1080/00344087.2019.1631954. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/00344087.2019.1631954>.
- Pirson, Michael. 2019. "A Humanistic Perspective for Management Theory: Protecting Dignity and Promoting Well-Being." *Journal of Business Ethics* 159 (1): 39-57. <https://www.proquest.com/politicalscience/docview/1975833669/2F66ECB494354DC1PQ/19?accountid=61;12874>.
- Pirson, Michael, Mario Vázquez-Maguirre, Canan Corus, Erica Steckler, and Andrew Wicks. 2019. "Dignity and the Process of Social Innovation: Lessons from Social Entrepreneurship and Transformative Services for Humanistic Management." *Humanistic Management Journal* 4 (2): 125-153. doi:10.1007/s41463-019-00071-9. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/2342446238>.
- Pless, Nicola M., Thomas Maak, and Howard Harris. 2017. "Art, Ethics and the Promotion of Human Dignity." *Journal of Business Ethics* 144 (1): 223-232. <https://search-proquest-com.proxy.library.nd.edu/politicalscience/docview/1930462600/89FC021ED36C4701PQ/24?accountid=12874>.
- Pollmann, Arnd. 2011. "Embodied Self-Respect and the Fragility of Human Dignity: A Human Rights Approach." In *Humiliation, Degradation, Dehumanization: Human Dignity Violated*, edited by Paulus Kaufmann, Hannes Kuch, Christian Neuhaeuser and Elaine Webster, 243-261. Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands. doi:10.1007/978-90-481-9661-6_17. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-90-481-9661-6_17.

- PRI / Association for the Prevention of Torture (APT). 2015. *Balancing Security and Dignity in Prisons: A Framework for Preventive Monitoring*. London.
- Pullman, Daryl. 2004. "Death, Dignity, and Moral Nonsense." *Journal of Palliative Care* 20 (3): 171-8.
- Renjen, Punit, Carmine Di Sibio, Bill Thomas, and Bob Moritz. 2020. *Toward Common Metrics and Consistent Reporting of Sustainable Value Creation* .
- Rocha Franco, Sérgio H. 2017. "Human Dignity and the Right to Adequate Housing in the Global Mega-Events Era: A Discussion from the Favelas of Rio De Janeiro." In *Human Dignity*, 263-277. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK. doi:10.1057/978-1-137-56005-6_16. http://link.springer.com/10.1057/978-1-137-56005-6_16.
- Sandkühler, Hans Jörg Iris and Florence. Oct. 10. "Human Dignity, and the Transformation of Moral Rights into Legal Rights." *Firenze University Press* 2 (4). <https://www.proquest.com/politicalscience/docview/856829819/2F66ECB494354DC1PQ/61?accountid==12874>.
- Santos, Cristina, Paul Anand, and Ron Smith. 2008. "The Measurement of Capabilities." In *Arguments for a Better World: Essays in Honor of Amartya Sen*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Schroeder, Doris. 2010. "Dignity: One, Two, Three, Four, Five, Still Counting." *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* 19 (1). <https://www.proquest.com/politicalscience/docview/201459151/fulltextPDF/2F66ECB494354DC1PQ/27?accountid==12874>.
- Shapiro, Jeremy. 2019. "The Impact of Recipient Choice on Aid Effectiveness." *World Development* 116: 137-149. doi:10.1016/j.worlddev.2018.10.010. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2018.10.010>.
- Short, Annabel. 2019. *Dignity by Design Human Rights and the Built Environment Lifecycle*.
- Shultziner, Doron and Itai Rabinovici. 2012. "Human Dignity, Self-Worth, and Humiliation: A Comparative Legal-Psychological Approach." *Psychology, Public Policy, and Law* 18 (1): 105-143. doi:10.1037/a0024585. <http://psycnet.apa.org/journals/law/18/1/105>.
- Shultziner, Doron and Guy E. Carmi. 2014. "Human Dignity in National Constitutions: Functions, Promises and Dangers." *The American Journal of Comparative Law* 62 (2): 461-490. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/43668212>.
- Simonyan, Maya. 2007. "Dignity and Health Related Quality of Life of Adult Residents of Yerevan: A Comparative Survey of Refugee and Non-Refugee Respondents. ." American University of Armenia.

- Sison, Alejo José G., Ignacio Ferrero, and Gregorio Guitián. 2016. "Human Dignity and the Dignity of Work: Insights from Catholic Social Teaching." *Business Ethics Quarterly* 26 (4): 503-528. doi:10.1017/beq.2016.18. <https://www.cambridge.org/core/article/human-dignity-and-the-dignity-of-work-insights-from-catholic-social-teaching/86A37FF416204464C52A3129D418F39B>.
- Skopin, Denis. 2016. "The NGO 'Soldiers' Mothers' in Russia and its Activities: Interpreted through the Concept of 'Human Dignity'." *Comparative Sociology* 15: 724-744. <https://doi.org/10.1163/15691330-12341408>.
- Sofia Villenas. 2011. "Latina Mothers and Small-Town Racisms: Creating Narratives of Dignity and Moral Education in North Carolina ." *Anthropology & Education Quarterly* 32 (1): 3-28. https://www-jstor-org.proxy.library.nd.edu/stable/pdf/3196209.pdf?ab_segments%252Fbasic_search_gsv2%252Ftest&refreqid%252Fexcelsior%3Af754f2f9dfef7cb2a12e99ba0369f560.
- Sotelo, Catrian M. 2021. "Human Dignity and the Best Interest of the Child." *Archivos Argentinos De Pediatría* 119 (2). doi:10.5546/aap.2021.eng.e113.
- Stabile, Susan J. 2006. "CST 101: Basic Principles of Catholic Social Thought." , 7+.
- Statman, Daniel. 2000. "Humiliation, Dignity and Self-Respect." *Philosophical Psychology* 13 (4): 523-540. doi:10.1080/09515080020007643. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09515080020007643>.
- Takeuchi, Laura Rodriguez. 2014. *Incorporating People's Values in Development Weighting Alternatives*. London.
- Tauber-Gilmore, Marcelle, Christine Norton, Sue Procter, Trevor Murrells, Gulen Addis, Lesley Baillie, Pauline Velasco, Preet Athwal, Saema Kayani, and Zainab Zahran. 2018. "Development of Tools to Measure Dignity for Older People in Acute Hospitals." *Journal of Clinical Nursing* 27 (19-20): 3706-3718. doi:10.1111/jocn.14490. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/jocn.14490>.
- Thiranagama, Sharika. 2019. "Respect Your Neighbor as Yourself: Neighborliness, Caste, and Community in South India." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 61 (2): 269-300. <https://www.proquest.com/politicalscience/docview/2210981737/EC23450EE66B408APQ/8?accountid%252F12874>.
- Thomas, Benjamin and Kristen Lucas. 2019. "Development and Validation of the Workplace Dignity Scale." *Group & Organization Management* 44 (1): 72-111. doi:10.1177/1059601118807784. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/1059601118807784>.

- Thompson, Genevieve N., Jennifer McArthur, and Malcolm Doupe. 2016. "Identifying Markers of Dignity-Conserving Care in Long-Term Care: A Modified Delphi Study." *PLoS One* 11 (6): e0156816. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0156816>.
<http://proxy.library.nd.edu/login?url=https://www-proquest-com.proxy.library.nd.edu/scholarly-journals/identifying-markers-dignity-conserving-care-long/docview/1797243415/se-2?accountid=12874>.
- Tschudi, Finn. 2008. "Dealing with Violent Conflicts and Mass Victimisation: A Human Dignity Approach." In *Restoring Justice After Large-Scale Violent Conflicts*, 71-94: Willan. doi:10.4324/9781843925590-11.
<https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/9781843925590/chapters/10.4324/9781843925590-11>.
- United Nations Secretary-General. 2014. *The Road to Dignity by 2030: Ending Poverty, Transforming all Lives and Protecting the Planet*. New York: United Nations.
- Van Tongeren, Paul. 2013. "Natural Law, Human Dignity and Catholic Social Teaching." *Religion, State & Society* 41 (2): 152-163. doi:10.1080/09637494.2013.805970.
<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09637494.2013.805970>.
- Venckiene, Egle. 2011. "The Right to Dignity: Terminological Aspects." *Jurisprudencija* 18 (1).
<https://www.proquest.com/politicalscience/docview/1427798724/abstract/2F66ECB494354DC1PQ/89?accountid=12874>.
- Ward, Tony and Kendra Syversen. 2008. "Human Dignity and Vulnerable Agency: An Ethical Framework for Forensic Practice." *Aggression and Violent Behavior* 14 (2): 94-105. doi:10.1016/j.avb.2008.12.002. <https://www.clinicalkey.es/playcontent/1-s2.0-S1359178908000840>.
- Wein, Tom. 2020. "Dignity and Development: A Review of the Literature on its Application, Definition and Measurement." *SSRN Electronic Journal*. doi:10.2139/ssrn.3739350.
- Westermann-Behaylo, M. K., Van Buren III, H. J., and S. L. Berman. 2016. "Stakeholder Capability Enhancement as a Path to Promote Human Dignity and Cooperative Advantage." *Business Ethics Quarterly* 26 (4): 529-555. doi:10.1017/beq.2016.46.
<https://www.narcis.nl/publication/RecordID/oai:dare.uva.nl:publications%2FO015d23f-865e-47a3-9807-285758cc07a2>.
- World Humanitarian Summit secretariat. 2015. *Restoring Humanity: Global Voices Calling for Action*. New York: United Nations.
- Xiao, Jinnan, Ka Ming Chow, Carmen Wh Chan, Minjie Li, and Ying Deng. 2020. "Qualitative Study on Perceived Dignity of Cancer Patients Undergoing Chemotherapy in China." *Supportive Care in Cancer* 28 (6): 2921-2929. doi:10.1007/s00520-019-05123-2.
<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/31768731>.

- Zavaleta Reyes, Diego. 2007. "The Ability to Go about without Shame: A Proposal for Internationally Comparable Indicators of Shame and Humiliation." *Oxford Development Studies* 35 (4): 405-430. doi:10.1080/13600810701701905. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13600810701701905>.
- Zhang, Qianfan. 2016. "Human Dignity: A Reconstruction of Confucianism." In *Human Dignity in Classical Chinese Philosophy*, 17-43. New York: Palgrave Macmillan US. doi:10.1057/978-1-349-70920-5_2. http://link.springer.com/10.1057/978-1-349-70920-5_2.
- Ziebertz, Hans-Georg, Susanne Döhnert, and Alexander Unser. 2017. "Predictors of Attitudes Towards Human Dignity: An Empirical Analysis among Youth in Germany." . doi:10.1007/978-3-319-59285-5_2.

Appendix A: Measurement Tools for Dignity-Related Concepts

Tool Name	Dignity-Associated Concepts	Tool Citation	Purpose of Tool	Level of Relevance
An Identity-Based Model of Culture in Action	Acceptance of Identity	Miles, Andrew. 2014. "Addressing the Problem of Cultural Anchoring: An Identity-Based Model of Culture in Action." Special Issue: Social Psychology and Culture: Advancing Connections. 77(2): 210-227.	Identities are a type of cultural content that provides traction on the problem of cultural anchoring. This tool is an identity-based model of action combines elements from multiple perspectives including "tool- kit theory."	High
Identity Conflicts at Work: An Interactive Framework	Acceptance of Identity	Horton, Kate; Bayerl, P. Saskia and Jacobs, Gabriele. 2013. "Identity Conflicts at Work: An Interactive Framework." Journal of Organizational Behavior 35: S6-822.	The framework identifies two different types of work-related identity conflicts, integrating evidence from different traditions and domains. Using cognitive dissonance theory and social identity approach to offer a framework that guides parties through the underlying mechanisms, triggers, and reconciliations of intra-unit and inter-unit conflicts within workplaces.	High
Reconciling the advantages and liabilities of foreignness: An identity-based framework	Acceptance of Identity	Edman, Jesper. 2016. "Reconciling the advantages and liabilities of foreignness: Towards an identity-based framework." Journal of International Business Studies. 47(6): 674-694.	The author proposes an identity-based view of foreignness. Drawing on both macro and micro identity approaches, the author conceptualizes foreignness as an organizational identity, composed of internal and external attributes. By accentuating or attenuating these attributes, subsidiaries manage their degree of foreignness in the host country. The	High

			author delineates the mechanisms by which these identity-specific attributes generate distinct advantages and liabilities in different country-level contexts. In particular, they suggest an accentuated foreign identity moderates the relationship between country-level conditions, and firm-level outcomes, both positive and negative. The model outlines the relationship between country-level conditions, foreign identity attributes, and their concomitant advantages and liabilities.	
Identity and Diversity Toolbox	Acceptance of Identity	Městský úřad Velké Meziříčí; Informa Giovani. 2012. "Identity and Diversity." Youth in Action Programme. 1-12.	This project IDENTITY AND DIVERSITY is a training course aimed to develop the European identity fostering European awareness sharing tools to do it and create a new tool box about European awareness through no formal methods to spread it all over Europe. The TC will take place in Palazzolo Acreide (SR), Italy, for 9 days from the 13th of January till the 20 of January 2012 (arrive and departure included); it will involve 4 young people from 7 European nations and neighbor countries: Poland, Lithuania, Czech Republic, Hungary, Portugal, Russia and Italy. The methods are non-formal activities, theatre techniques, simulations, role playing and workshops. The expected follow-up are new similar projects or local projects because the aim is to give new work instruments to the participant youth workers.	High
Increasing Strategic	Accountability	Cavill, Sue; Sohail, M. 2007. "Increasing Strategic	The accountability of international development NGOs (INGOs) has attracted a	Medium

<p>Accountability: A Framework for International NGOs</p>		<p>Accountability: A Framework for International NGOs." Development in Practice. 17(2): 231-248.</p>	<p>great deal of interest from academics and development practitioners. INGO accountability falls into two categories: practical accountability (for the use of inputs, the way activities are performed, and outputs) and strategic accountability for INGOs' performance in relation to their mission. This article presents a conceptual framework for exploring INGO accountability.</p>	
<p>Measuring social accountability in health professional education: Development and international pilot testing of an evaluation framework</p>	<p>Accountability</p>	<p>Larkins, Sarah L.; Preston, Robyn; Matte, Marie C.; Lindemann, Iris C.; Samson, Rex; Tandino, Filedito D.; Buso, David; Ross, Simone J.; Pálsdóttir, Björg and Neusy, André-Jacques. 2013. "Measuring social accountability in health professional education: development and international pilot testing of an evaluation framework." Medical Teacher 35(1): 32-45.</p>	<p>This article describes the development of THEnet evaluation framework for socially accountable health professional education, presents the framework to be used as a tool by other schools and discusses the findings of pilot implementation at five schools. METHODS: The framework was designed collaboratively and built on Boelen and Woollard's conceptualization, production and usability model. It includes key components, linked to aspirational statements, indicators and suggested measurement tools. Five schools completed pilot implementation, involving workshops, document/data review and focus group discussions with faculty, students and community members.</p>	<p>Medium</p>
<p>MEALDPro</p>	<p>Accountability</p>	<p>Culligan, Mike; Sherriff, Leslie. 2019. "MEALDPro." Catholic Relief Service. 1-141.</p>	<p>Development, conservation and humanitarian relief organizations manage their work through projects. Their offices are staffed by project teams that write project proposals, develop plans, implement activities, and track progress and impact. To thrive and succeed, these organizations</p>	<p>Medium</p>

			<p>need to develop the knowledge and skills to manage their projects well. Every organization's project management process is unique, reflecting its culture, systems, policies and programmatic activities. Nevertheless, all project management models have at least one thing in common: Strong monitoring, evaluation, accountability and learning (MEAL) is critical to project success. The Guide to the MEAL DPro helps teams design, plan and implement MEAL in their projects. It provides clear, practical guidance and tools that can immediately be applied to their work. The guide is written for project team members working in the development, humanitarian and conservation sector who are not specialists in MEAL. It is intended to benefit project officers, project administrators, project coordinators and other team members. It will also help MEAL officers who may be new to the sector or their responsibilities.</p>	
--	--	--	---	--

Measurement of respect of human dignity in international development	Acknowledgement	Wein, Tom. 2020. Dignity and Development: A Review of the Literature on its Application, Definition and Measurement	<p>Contains two tools to measure dignity in development from peer-reviewed sources:</p> <p>1) Index on autonomy, dignity, and trust. Is composed of weighted, standardized survey questions intended to evaluate recipient's preferences in the effectiveness of aid programs.</p> <p>2) Dignity Index. It measures an entire country's progress towards sustainable development, by including measures of human development, as well as measures of happiness.</p> <p>This article also mentions non-peer reviewed attempts to measure respectfulness, respectedness or dignity in international development. In addition, it contains measurements in social psychology and medicine.</p>	High
---	-----------------	---	---	------

<p>The A, B, C, and D of dignity in conserving care</p>	<p>Acknowledgement</p>	<p>Chochinov, Harvey Max. 2007. "Dignity and the Essence of Medicine: The A, B, C, and D of Dignity Conserving Care." <i>Bmj</i> 335 (7612): 184-187. doi:10.1136/bmj.39244.650926.47</p>	<p>The article provides a framework of dignity conserving care in the medical field. It is composed of a set of questions in 4 categories (arranged in an ABCD mnemonic): Attitude, Behaviors, Compassion, and Dialogue intended to induce a reflection of clinical caregivers to uphold, protect, and restore the dignity of those who seek their care.</p>	<p>High</p>
--	------------------------	---	--	-------------

Model of Dignity and Dignity-Conserving interventions for Patients Nearing Death	Acknowledgement	<p>———. 2002. "Dignity-Conserving Care--a New Model for Palliative Care: Helping the Patient Feel Valued." <i>Journal of the American Medical Association</i> 287 (17): 2253–2260. doi:10.1001/jama.287.17.2253. https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/11980525/</p>	<p>This model provides dignity-related questions for several subthemes of care in medical context, specifically for patients in terminal stage. Accompanying these questions there are therapeutic interventions suggested for each type of subtheme.</p>	High
Dignity Therapy	Acknowledgement	<p>Houmann, Lise J., Susan Rydahl-Hansen, Harvey M. Chochinov, Linda J. Kristjanson, and Mogens Groenvold. 2010. "Testing the Feasibility of the Dignity Therapy Interview: Adaptation for the Danish Culture." <i>BMC Palliative Care</i> 9 (1): 21. doi:10.1186/1472-684X-9-21. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20860786</p>	<p>Tool designed for palliative care consisting in interview questions that a caregiver makes to a patient. This tool proposes a dynamic in which the caregiver records and transcribe the patient's answers into a coherence narrative. The patient receives a hard copy that can be handed out to relatives and friends. This dynamic is intended to increase the patient's acknowledgement of its value / dignity and its contribution to others (personal and societal level).</p>	High

<p>Worldwide Governance Indicators</p>	<p>Empowerment to participate/ voice/ agency</p>	<p>World Bank Institute. 2009. "Governance Matters 2009: Worldwide Governance Indicators 1996-2008 ." 1-2.</p>	<p>For over a decade the Worldwide Governance Indicators (WGI) have been instrumental in enabling such research, fostering debate and discussion, and raising awareness about governance issues in the development community and beyond. This is the eighth installment of the Governance Matters research paper series. The WGI capture six dimensions of governance for more than 200 countries and territories between 1996 and 2008. They organize and synthesize data reflecting the views of thousands of stakeholders worldwide, including respondents to household and firm surveys, and experts from nongovernmental organizations, public sector agencies, and providers of commercial business information.</p> <p>Voice and accountability captures perceptions of the extent to which a country's citizens are able to participate in selecting their government, as well as freedom of expression, freedom of association, and a free media. This table lists the individual variables from each data source used to construct this measure in the Worldwide Governance Indicators</p>	<p>Medium</p>
---	--	--	--	---------------

<p>Scale of Internal and External Humiliation</p>	<p>Humiliation</p>	<p>Zavaleta Reyes, Diego. 2009. "The Ability to go about Without Shame: A Proposal for Internationally Comparable Indicators of Shame and Humiliation." <i>Oxford Development Studies</i>. 35(4): 405-430.</p>	<p>proposed indicators of shame and of humiliation that would add a valuable dimension to our understanding and measurement of poverty, and proposed a shortlist of questions that could be used to capture the necessary information to construct these indicators. The data generated could provide a starting point to answer some important questions about the relationship between shame and income poverty:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> . Are shame and humiliation aspects of absolute poverty, as Sen has argued? . Do lower economic levels correlate with shame-proneness? . Does shame increase if poverty worsens, or vice versa, over time? . Does the stigma of poverty relate to shame-proneness? . Are ashamed people less likely to take actions to change their lives? <p>More broadly, these data could feed into a richer multidimensional measure of poverty that includes not only objective criteria but also associated perceptions. Though little work has been done—particularly within economics—to measure shame and humiliation, and the concepts are complex and difficult to capture, historical and contemporary evidence highlights their importance to a full understanding of poverty</p>	<p>Medium</p>
--	--------------------	--	---	---------------

Autonomy, dignity, trust index & Dignity index	Inclusion; Independence, Autonomy, and Agency	Wein, Tom. 2020. "Dignity and development: a review of the literature on its application, definition and measurement." Dignity Project: 1-59.	Dignity is much discussed in development, but only rarely investigated in any depth. The indexes offered in this article offers some conclusions from this review, and makes the link to the definitional and measurement work that will follow.	High
Core Metrics for Dignity and Equality	Inclusion	Deloitte, EY, KPMG and PwC. 2020. "Toward Common Metrics and Consistent Reporting of Sustainable Value Creation." WeForum 1-48.	This report proposes a common, core set of metrics and recommended disclosures that IBC members could use to align their mainstream reporting and, in so doing, reduce fragmentation and encourage faster progress towards a systemic solution, perhaps to include a generally accepted international accounting standard. To the maximum extent practicable, the report incorporates well-established metrics and disclosures for the express purpose of building upon the extensive and rigorous work that has already been done by those who have developed the existing standards. The objective is to amplify those standards and more fully harness their synergies rather than create a new standard altogether.	High
Questions for Discussion on Leadership	Inclusion	Pless, Nicola M.; Appel, Jenny. 2012. "In Pursuit of Dignity and Social Justice: Changing Lives Through 100% Inclusion—How Gram Vikas Fosters Sustainable Rural Development." Journal of Business Ethics. 111(3): 389-411.	This case study investigates Gram Vikas' innovative social entrepreneurial approach to sustainable rural development through its 'Water and Sanitation Programme'. We explore its key innovation of 100 % inclusion and the process of creating democratic, self-governing management systems. This allows us to demonstrate how a social enterprise tries to realize its vision of "an equitable and sustainable society where people live in peace with dignity", and ultimately, how it	High

			contributes to the United Nations Millennium Goals of improving health, empowering women and breaking the vicious circle of poverty.	
Workplace Dignity Scale	Inclusion	Thomas, Benjamin; Lucas, Kristen. 2018. "Development and Validation of the Workplace Dignity Scale." <i>Group & Organization Management</i> . 44(1): 72-111.	Models workplace dignity with observed antecedents and outcomes.	High
Relative Autonomy Index	Independence, Autonomy, and Agency	Vaz, A. et al. 2019. "Measuring Autonomy: Evidence from Bangladesh." <i>Asia-Pacific Sustainable Development Journal</i> 2018 (2): 21-51. doi:10.18356/040ad3b0-en.	The index is built on the concept of self-regulation under the Self Determination Theory. Within this framework, the RAI measures the extent to which the individual's motivation for her behavior in a specific domain is fairly autonomous as opposed to somewhat controlled. The RAI can be seen as a direct measure of the individual's ability to act on what she values across different aspects of her life.	High
Index of Autonomous Functioning	Independence, Autonomy, and Agency	Weinstein, N., Przybylski, A. K., & Ryan, R. M. (2012). "The index of autonomous functioning: Development of a scale of human autonomy. <i>Journal of Research in Personality</i> ", 46, 397-413. doi: 10.1016/j.jrp.2012.03.007	This index provides a measure of trait autonomy based on three theoretically derived subscales assessing authorship/self-congruence, interest-taking, and low susceptibility to control.	High

The Motivators' Orientations Questionnaires	Independence, Autonomy, and Agency		Includes a set of questionnaires to assess whether individuals in a position of authority, whose job is, in part, to motivate others, tend to be oriented toward controlling the behavior of those others versus supporting their autonomy. Questions are designed to be applied to teachers in a school environment or leaders in a work environment. Such questions can be adapted to measure development practitioners' ability to engender autonomy among recipients.	High
Tools for measuring agency	Independence, Autonomy, and Agency	IBRAHIM, SOLAVA and SABINA ALKIRE. 2007. "Agency and Empowerment: A Proposal for Internationally Comparable Indicators." Oxford Development Studies 35 (4): 379-403. doi:10.1080/13600810701701897	The two articles provide a summary of tools and indicators to measure agency.	High
Psychological security of urban residents	Safety	Wang, Jiaqi, Ruyin Long, Hong Chen, and Qianwen Li. 2019. "Measuring the Psychological Security of Urban Residents: Construction and Validation of a New Scale." Frontiers in Psychology 10: 2423. doi:10.3389/fpsyg.2019.02423	This article provides a bibliography on existing studies in psychological security and its different dimensions, a model of urban residents' psychological security, and an interview outline.	Medium

Danger Assessment in violent relationships	Safety	Campbell, J. C. (1986). Nursing assessment for risk of homicide with battered women. <i>Advances in Nursing Science</i> , 8(4), 36.	This tool is used to identify risk factors that are associated with homicides (murders) of women and men in violent relationships. The elements assessed are proxies of physical and psychological safety.	Medium
Safety climate, attitudes, satisfaction with safety status, risk perception and behaviour	Safety	Rundmo, T. 2000. "Safety Climate, Attitudes and Risk Perception in Norsk Hydro: Safety Culture & Climate." <i>Safety Science</i> 34 (1-3): 47-5	The tool is derived from a study of safety among mining & manufacturing workers. Safety status included the following four dimensions: (1) employee influence and communication with management, (2) personal protection equipment, (3) rules and instructions, and (4) satisfaction with other people.	Medium
Physical Safety and Security: A Proposal for Internationally Comparable Indicators of Violence	Safety	Diprose, Rachael. 2007. "Physical Safety and Security: A Proposal for Internationally Comparable Indicators of Violence." <i>Oxford Development Studies</i> 35 (4): 431-458. doi:10.1080/13600810701701913.	Provides indicators of safety through multiple tools on topics including domestic violence, threats to physical safety and security (against property and persons), and perceptions of safety and violence.	Medium
COOPERSMITH SELF-ESTEEM INVENTORY	Self Esteem	Coopersmith, S. (1967). <i>The antecedents of self-esteem</i> . San Francisco: W. H. Freeman & Co.	A 50-item measure of attitudes toward oneself. The inventory was originally designed to measure children's self-esteem. However, it was modified by Ryden (1978) for use on adults. For each item, participants answer whether the statement provided is "like me" or "not like me".	Medium
Improved representation of the self-perception profile for children	Self Esteem	Arens, A. Katrin; Morin, Alexandre J. S. 2017. "Improved representation of the self-perception profile for children	As organizational scholars have become critically attuned to human flourishing in the workplace, interest in workplace dignity has grown rapidly. Yet, a valid scale to measure	Medium

<p>through bifactor exploratory structural equation modeling</p>		<p>through bifactor exploratory structural equation modeling." American educational research journal 54 (2017) 1, S. 59-87, 10.3102/0002831216666490</p>	<p>employees' perceptions of dignity in the workplace has yet to be developed, thereby limiting potential empirical insights. To fill this need, we conducted a systematic, multi-study scale development project. Using data generated from focus groups (N = 62), an expert panel (N = 11), and two surveys (N = 401 and N = 542), we developed and validated an 18-item Workplace Dignity Scale (WDS). Our studies reveal evidence in support of the WDS' psychometric properties, as well as its content, construct, and criterion-related validity. Our structural models support predictive relationships between workplace characteristics (e.g., dirty work, income insufficiency) and dignity. Moreover, we observed the incremental validity of workplace dignity to account for variance in employee engagement, burnout, and turnover intentions above and beyond the explanatory effects of organizational respect and meaningful work. These results demonstrate th</p>	
<p>ROSENBERG SELF-ESTEEM SCALE</p>	<p>Self Esteem</p>	<p>Rosenberg, M. (1965). Society and the adolescent self-image. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.</p>	<p>A 10-item scale that measures global self-worth by measuring both positive and negative feelings about the self. The scale is believed to be uni-dimensional. All items are answered using a 4-point Likert scale format ranging from strongly agree to strongly disagree.</p>	<p>Medium</p>

<p>A dialogue map of leader and leadership development methods: A communication tool</p>	<p>Transparency and Communication</p>	<p>Kjellstrom, Sofia; Tomblom, Oskar and Stalne, Kristian. 2020. "A dialogue map of leader and leadership development methods: A communication tool." <i>Cognet Business and Management</i>. 7(1717051): 1-21.</p>	<p>The dialogue map is a new pedagogical framework that provides an overview of leader and leadership development methods and is designed to facilitate dialogues about how to promote leadership development. The aim was to create and test a dialogue map.</p>	<p>Low</p>
<p>Transparency in Corporate Reporting</p>	<p>Transparency and Communication</p>	<p>Debere, Stephanie. 2018. "Transparency in Corporate Reporting." <i>Transparency International</i>: 1-5.</p>	<p>TRAC assesses and ranks major companies according to their disclosure practices in crucial areas. These include anti-corruption programmes, organizational transparency and financial information on a country-by-country basis – with beneficial ownership information soon to be added. Disclosure of this information demonstrates a company’s commitment to countering corruption, enables others to hold companies to account and helps improve international perceptions of a country’s overall business integrity.</p>	<p>Low</p>
<p>Interactive Web Tools in Environmental Planning to Improve Communication about Sustainable Development</p>	<p>Transparency and Communication</p>	<p>Kratzig, Sebastian and Bartlett, Warren-Kretzschmar. 2014. "Using Interactive Web Tools in Environmental Planning to Improve Communication about Sustainable Development." <i>Sustainability</i> 6: 236-250. doi:10.3390/su6010236.</p>	<p>This article examines how communication in the context of environmental issues can be supported by modern web tools, social media, and new visualization approaches. Furthermore, the potential of social media to support communication about sustainability on a local scale and the prerequisites for its use in the planning process are discussed. Using a framework for the use of social media, we suggest different application levels of social media in participatory planning. Finally, the opportunities to support sustainable</p>	<p>Low</p>

			decisions with landscape visualization in environmental planning and decision-making issues are discussed.	
Developing an Instrument for Measuring Human Dignity and its Relationship to Health	Respect	Khatib, Rasha and Haroutune Armenian. 2010. "Developing an Instrument for Measuring Human Dignity and its Relationship to Health in Palestinian Refugees." <i>World Medical and Health Policy</i> 2 (2): 35-49. doi:10.2202/1948-4682.1077.	Provides a generic set of questions which can be utilized in a survey or open ended interview to measure qualities related to respect and other related elements of human dignity.	Medium
Development and Validation of the Workplace Dignity Scale	Respect	Thomas, Benjamin and Kristen Lucas. 2019. "Development and Validation of the Workplace Dignity Scale." <i>Group & Organization Management</i> 44 (1): 72-111. doi:10.1177/1059601118807784.	Provides factors of workplace dignity and their respective indicators which are mainly related to respect but also other concepts relevant for CRS.	Medium
Development of the Attributed Dignity Scale	Respect, Seek Understanding	Jacelon, Cynthia S. and Jeungok Choi. 2014. "Evaluating the Psychometric Properties of the Jacelon Attributed Dignity Scale." <i>Journal of Advanced Nursing</i> 70 (9): 2149-2161. doi:10.1111/jan.12372.	Tool which measures self value, behavioral respect towards oneself, and behavioral respect towards others. The 18 item scale that compose this tool can be utilized in surveys to better understand respondent's perception of dignity towards oneself and others.	Medium

Measurement of respect of human dignity in international development copy	Respect	Wein, Tom. 2020. Dignity and Development: A Review of the Literature on its Application, Definition and Measurement	Contains two tools to measure dignity in development from peer-reviewed sources: 1) Index on autonomy, dignity, and trust. Is composed of weighted, standardized survey questions intended to evaluate recipient's preferences in the effectiveness of aid programs. 2) Dignity Index. It measures an entire country's progress towards sustainable development, by including measures of human development, as well as measures of happiness. This article also mentions non-peer reviewed attempts to measure respectfulness, respectedness or dignity in international development. In addition, it contains measurements in social psychology and medicine.	Medium
Dignity and the Health Related Quality of Life	Respect		The authors examine health metrics of refugees in Yerevan who have been displaced from Azerbaijan and Artsakh. Among them, they have a Dignity Questionnaire comprised of 18 item survey questions to determine respondents' perception of their dignity.	Medium

Dignity Index: A Developing Proposal	Respect		<p>This article delves into the usage of multiple tools (Human Rights Index, Human Oppression Index, and Human Expression Index) to form a Human Dignity Index. It contains a table with 5 levels of respect for humans (a proxy for respect for human dignity) accompanied by a list of indignities that can be observed in the absence of respect.</p> <p>Additionally, based on a person or group's Oppression or Expression Index score, they can be categorized on a 1-5 scale based on how much respect they receive.</p>	Medium
Tools for seeking understanding from the medicine field	Seek Understanding	Chochinov, Harvey Max. 2007. "Dignity and the Essence of Medicine: The A, B, C, and D of Dignity Conserving Care." <i>Bmj</i> 335 (7612): 184-187. doi:10.1136/bmj.39244.650926.47	Dignity in the Essence of Medicine is a good starting point for understanding medicine and its interaction with seeking understanding. It lists open ended interview questions which can give the reader a basic understanding of this trait. With this knowledge, one can utilize other interview tools seen in Adapting the Portugese Dignity Question, Defining Dignity in End of Life Care, Dignity Therapy: A Novel Psychotherapeutic Intervention, Dignity Therapy Feasibility, and a Qualitative Study on Perceived Dignity and form an interview (or possibly survey) tool that is best suited for the researcher team's needs.	Medium
Dignity Self-Assessment	Multi-Dimensional	Donna Hicks (Unpublished)	This is a general tool that allows users to self-assess to what extent they experience validation of dignity at work through the	High

			lens of Donna Hicks' Essential Elements of Dignity.	
Dignity Honoring Assessment	Multi-Dimensional	Donna Hicks (Unpublished)	This is a general tool that allows users to self-assess to what extent they honor other people's dignity in their day-to-day lives through the lens of Donna Hicks' Essential Elements of Dignity.	High